UNITED
NATIONS

E

Economic and Social Council

Distr.
GENERAL

E/AC.51/1991/3
4 April 1991

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

COMMITTEE FOR PROGRAMME AND CO-ORDINATION
Thirty-first session
13 May-7 June 1991
Item 3 (d) of the provisional agenda*

PROGRAMME QUESTIONS: EVALUATION

In-depth evaluation of the development issues and policies programme: Economic Commission for Africa

Final report of the Secretary-General

SUMMARY

At its thirtieth session, in 1990, the Committee for Programme and Coordination recommended that the final evaluation report on the development issues and policies programme of the Economic Commission for Africa, to be submitted to it at its thirty-first session, should bring together the findings, conclusions and recommendations of existing evaluations and reviews, and follow-up actions by the Secretariat and intergovernmental bodies. The present report reviews the evolution of the principal mandates and strategies of the programme, summarizes the findings of completed assessments and evaluations of the Multinational Programming and Operational Centres and the Pan-African Documentation and Information System, and provides an examination of the effects of extrabudgetary resources on the Commission's programmes. The final section contains recommendations which can be the basis of action by the Committee.

* E/AC.51/1991/1.

CONTENTS

	Paragraphs	Page
INTRODUCTION	1 - 9	4
I. EVOLUTION OF THE MANDATES AND STRATEGIES OF THE ECA PROGRAMME ON DEVELOPMENT ISSUES AND POLICIES	10 - 17	5
II. EXISTING ASSESSMENTS AND EVALUATIONS	18 - 48	8
A. Subregional strategies for economic cooperation and development	18 - 38	8
1. Objectives and issues	18 - 24	8
2. Evaluation of MULPOCs	25 - 27	9
3. Follow-up actions	28 - 31	11
4. Observations on the programmatic implications of these assessments and actions	32 - 38	12
B. Collection, management and dissemination of development information	39 - 45	15
1. Scope and objectives of PADIS	39 - 41	15
2. UNDP evaluation of PADIS	42 - 43	15
3. Follow-up actions	44	17
4. Observations on programmatic implications	45	17
C. Contributions of the programme to regional economic cooperation and to international responses to the recurrent economic and social crisis	46 - 48	18
III. EFFECTS OF EXTRABUDGETARY RESOURCES ON PRIORITIES AMONG ECA PROGRAMMES	49 - 61	19
A. Priorities among ECA programmes	49 - 50	19
B. Methodologies for assessing the effects of extrabudgetary funds on priorities	51 - 55	19
C. Significance of extrabudgetary funds in ECA	56 - 58	20
D. Effect of extrabudgetary funds on priorities	59 - 61	22
IV. RECOMMENDATIONS	62 - 63	25

CONTENTS (continued)

Page

ANNEXES

I. Substantive support of MULPOCs in the 1990-1991 work programme of ECA . 27

II. Regular budget resources of ECA: final appropriation to programmes, 1986-1987 and 1988-1989 28

III. Extrabudgetary resources of ECA: direct allocations to programmes, 1986-1987 and 1988-1989 29

INTRODUCTION

1. The programme of the Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) on development issues and policies has become the fulcrum of efforts to evaluate the role and contributions of ECA activities to regional economic cooperation and integration and, in the light of recent intergovernmental decisions, of formulating credible and effective international responses to the economic and social crisis in Africa.

2. The Committee for Programme and Coordination (CPC), at its twenty-seventh session, in 1987, recommended that the ECA programme be included in the in-depth evaluation of the major programme on development issues and policies. The Committee further noted that "the study should enable ECA to establish priorities in its activities to develop a programme of action for providing support to member States in addresing major economic and social problems through regional and subregional cooperation efforts". 1/ At its twenty-ninth session, in 1989, the Committee considered an in-depth evaluation report that reviewed the priorities and implementation of the ECA programme and policies on development issues (E/AC.51/1989/4/Add.2 and Add.2/Corr.1), and it recommended modifications of the programme structure. The Committee took note of the report but also requested that an in-depth evaluation of the ECA programme be carried out and submitted to it at its thirty-first session. 2/ In an earlier and related action, the General Assembly, in its resolution 43/216 of 21 December 1988, endorsed the concurring observations and recommendations of the Board of Auditors 3/ and the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions (ACABQ) (A/43/674, para. 13) on the question of the Multinational Programming and Operational Centres (MULPOCs) and the Pan-African Documentation and Information System (PADIS).

3. At its thirtieth session, in 1990, the Committee considered the progress report of the Secretary-General (E/AC.51/1990/5), which contained information on the status of planned evaluation studies and a summary of the conclusions and recommendations of a completed self-evaluation of subprogramme 1 of the programme on development issues and policies. The report also included proposals on the approach to be taken in the final report. Following its consideration of that report, the Committee recommended that the final evaluation report, to be submitted to it at its thirty-first session, should bring together the findings, conclusions and recommendations of existing evaluations and reviews, and follow-up actions by the Secretariat and intergovernmental bodies. 4/

4. The present report includes an analytical summary of the findings and recommendations of:

(a) The report on the Structures, Organization and Operations of the Multinational Programming and Operational Centres conducted by a Review Team appointed by the Under-Secretary-General for Administration and Management and the Executive Secretary of ECA (E/ECA/CM.16/13);

(b) The report of the evaluation mission of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) on PADIS.

5. Several other evaluations are also being or have been undertaken as part of the broader and continuing intergovernmental concern and interest in evolving an effective international and regional response to the situation. In its resolution 45/178 A of 19 December 1990, the General Assembly scheduled a final review and appraisal of the implementation of the United Nations Programme of Action for African Economic Recovery and Development 1986-1990 (Assembly resolution S-13/2, annex). At its forty-sixth session, the Assembly will have before it the report of the Ad Hoc Committee of the Whole, established for the purpose of preparing that review, and the assessment of the Administrative Committee on Coordination (ACC) on the implementation of the Programme of Action.

6. In 1988, the Commission prepared an assessment entitled "African Alternative Framework for Structural Adjustment Programmes for Socio-Economic Recovery and Transformation" (A/44/315, annex). The twenty-fifth session of the Commission and 16th meeting of the Conference of Ministers of ECA reviewed the implementation of the United Nations Programme of Action and decided in resolution 699 (XXV) to submit, in May 1991, a special memorandum to the Ad Hoc Committee of the Whole on the basis of the Commission's assessment of the United Nations Programme of Action.

7. At its twenty-sixth session, in May 1991, the Commission will also conduct an assessment of the first decade of the Lagos Plan of Action. The conclusions and recommendations of the Commission in that regard will help update strategies for regional economic cooperation and integration.

8. Taken together, the findings and conclusions contained in those reviews and assessments will provide, when all are completed, a realistic assessment of the context and environment of the programmes of the Commission in general and its programme on development issues and policies in particular. The present report focuses on those aspects of the ECA programme on development issues and policies which have been the subject of completed evaluations and consequent intergovernmental review and actions.

9. Section I of the present report reviews the evolution of the principal mandates and strategies of the programme and its contributions to the implementation of intergovernmental objectives, especially those endorsed in the Lagos Plan of Action and the United Nations Programme of Action. Section II of the report summarizes the findings of completed assessments and evaluations of the MULPOCs and PADIS. Section III is an examination of the effects of extrabudgetary resources on ECA programmes. The final section contains recommendations that can be the basis of action by the Committee.

I. EVOLUTION OF THE MANDATES AND STRATEGIES OF THE ECA PROGRAMME ON DEVELOPMENT ISSUES AND POLICIES

10. The mandates of ECA programmes are based on resolutions and decisions of the General Assembly, the Economic and Social Council and the Commission itself. Further, the Commission is often a conduit for major assessments of economic and social development by the Organization of Africn Unity (OAU) or joint initiatives of ECA and OAU. The secretariats of the two organizations have formed a steering

committee for collaborative work. Such assessments and joint initiatives are, in turn, submitted for endorsement by the Economic and Social Council and the General Assembly.

11. Twelve resolutions of the Assembly, four of the Council and eight of the Commission are cited in the medium-term plan for the period 1992-1997 (see A/45/6, prog. 30) as legislative mandates of ECA activities on development issues and policies. All of those resolutions, adopted within the past five years (1986 to 1990), reaffirm the responsibility of the Commission by elaborating the scope and strategies of the programme on development issues and policies.

12. A review of the current and past resolutions, including those defining the terms of reference of the Commission, illustrates the scope of the activities of the Commission, which consist of (a) facilitating concerted action for strengthening economic cooperation in the region through analysis and assessment of development trends, strategies and policies, (b) overcoming structural and transnational obstacles to economic development through more coherent subregional economic cooperation and integration, and (c) facilitating a coherent policy response on the part of the international community and African Governments to the critical economic situation in Africa.

13. The first category of mandated activity illustrates the regional dimensions of international cooperation for development, in which regional commissions of the United Nations system are mandated to conduct research and analysis on development issues. The responsibility of the Commissions in that regard was reaffirmed by the Assembly in its resolution 32/197, in paragraph 21 of annex IV of which it authorized the regional commissions to "provide inputs for global policy-making processes of the competent United Nations organs and participate fully in the implementation of the relevant policy and programming decisions taken by these organs". In ECA, the programme on development issues and policies, as elaborated in the medium-term plan for the period 1984-1989 (extended to 1991), enables the Commission to perform the functions of collecting, evaluating and analysing information on socio-economic conditions. Other activities within this programme are designed to service subsidiary regional intergovernmental bodies or promote technical cooperation among member States.

14. The second category of mandated activity aims at coordinating and strengthening subregional economic cooperation and integration. The strategies for subregional cooperation are derived from the terms of reference of the Commission and the Lagos Plan of Action for the Implementation of the Monrovia Strategy for the Economic Development of Africa (A/S-11/14, annex I). The Lagos Plan of Action, adopted in 1980 and endorsed by the General Assembly, envisaged the strengthening of existing subregional communities and the establishment of other economic groupings to cover the entire continent and the coordination and harmonization among existing and future economic groupings for a gradual establishment of an African common market.

15. The third type of mandated activity reflects efforts to develop a coherent and coordinated international policy response to the recurrent critical economic situation. The most recent principal mandates for those efforts are incorporated

in the United Nations Programme of Action for African Economic Recovery and Development 1986-1990, which the General Assembly adopted at its thirteenth special session. The Programme of Action, reaffirmed and elaborated in subsequent resolutions of the Economic and Social Council and the General Assembly and the Commission, is the basis of a new programme in the medium-term plan for the period 1992-1997 entitled "Africa: critical economic situation, recovery and transformation" (A/45/6, prog. 45). The programme is designed to provide a framework for United Nations system-wide activities. The objectives of the programme are the following:

(a) To ensure that the critical problems confronting Africa will be addressed effectively and urgently in a coordinated manner by the international community, including the United Nations system;

(b) To encourage the international community to translate its commitment to assisting Africa in achieving economic development and transformation into effective policy measures;

(c) To mobilize increased resource flows to Africa;

(d) To increase awareness at the global level of the critical economic situation in Africa and the actions needed to improve that situation;

(e) To support African countries in their efforts to enhance their own endogenous capacity with a view to achieving sustained growth and development by, inter alia, providing, at the request of individual Governments, advice on appropriate economic policy reforms.

The coordination of the United Nations activities for the implementation of the Programme of Action is assigned to the Office of the Director-General for Development and International Economic Cooperation. ECA will be closely associated with the policy and substantive aspects of the programme through the Conference of Ministers of the Commission and through ACC.

16. The objectives and strategies of the ECA programme on development issues and policies in the medium-term plans for the periods 1984-1991 and 1992-1997 incorporate those mandates. The strategies of the eight subprogrammes in the 1984-1989 plan, subsequently extended to 1991, addressed regional aspects of global obstacles and challenges to development, as analysed and assessed at the regional level in the Lagos Plan of Action, and at the global level in the International Development Strategy for the Third United Nations Development Decade (Assembly resolution 35/56, annex). The programme therefore subsumed a broad spectrum of activities designed to contribute to the coordination of appropriate collective regional policy responses and strategies and to the monitoring and assessment of the implementation of internationally agreed objectives and strategies for the decade. In the current biennium, 1990-1991, activities in support of subregional economic cooperation are included in 7 of the 16 programmes of the medium-term plan.

17. In the medium-term plan for the period 1992-1997 the structure of the programmes has been modified. The subprogramme on development issues and policies

focuses on activities that aim at better understanding socio-economic trends and policy issues. The promotion of regional economic cooperation and integration is now identified as a distinct subprogramme that includes the activities to be carried out by the five MULPOCs and their coordinating unit at ECA headquarters, the Economic Cooperation Office. Other subprogrammes will, however, continue to include activities in support of subregional economic cooperation, as shown in annex I. At its thirtieth session, CPC recommended the addition of two other subprogrammes on the external debt crisis in Africa and on tourism. 5/ The modified structure brings into sharper focus the dominant concerns of the States members of the Commission.

II. EXISTING ASSESSMENTS AND EVALUATIONS

A. Subregional strategies for economic cooperation and development

1. Objectives and issues

18. In the Final Act of Lagos (A/S-11/14, annex II), the States members of OAU reaffirmed their commitment to set up, by the year 2000, on the basis of a treaty to be concluded, an African economic community so as to ensure the economic, social and cultural integration of the African continent. To achieve that goal, the member States committed themselves to:

(a) Strengthening the existing regional economic communities and establishing other economic groupings in other regions of Africa so as to cover the continent as a whole (Central Africa, eastern Africa, southern Africa and northern Africa);

(b) Promoting coordination and harmonization among existing and future economic groupings for a gradual establishment of an African common market;

(c) Taking measures to effect the establishment of an African common market and other measures that would lead to the attainment of the aims and objectives of the African economic community.

19. The Lagos Plan of Action incorporated subregional measures and strategies in all its aspects and sectors in order to complement national measures and strategies and to serve as the foundation for regional economic integration.

20. In food and agriculture, the Plan called on member States to "expand their economic and technical cooperation in food and agriculture through increased trade, exchange of manpower, technology, and joint development programmes at the subregional and regional levels" (A/S-11/14, annex I, para. 47).

21. In industry (ibid., para. 70), the Plan enumerated a broad spectrum of measures, including preparation of subregional plans for the creation of major industrial complexes, creation of subregional institutions to make inventory of and exploit shared natural resources, giving high priority to the establishment of multinational industries, harmonization of tax systems at the subregional levels in order to facilitate industrial cooperation.

22. In response to those mandates for subregional cooperation, ECA established in 1977 five Multinational Programming and Operational Centres (MULPOCs). The Centres were conceived as vehicles for promoting subregional economic cooperation both at the intergovernmental and ECA-secretariat levels. To that effect, ECA assisted member States in drafting legal instruments of subregional cooperation and in establishing and servicing subregional intergovernmental bodies. Those subregional intergovernmental bodies were to coordinate development policies and promote joint programmes of member States of the subregion.

23. ECA also established a secretariat unit responsible for overall policies for subregional economic cooperation and integration. As of 1982, the Economic Cooperation Office had 13 regular budget Professional posts, with an additional 24 Professional posts assigned to the Centres and funded from extrabudgetary resources. Over the next four biennial budgets, funding of the staff of the MULPOCs was transferred totally to the regular budget. Currently, the staffing of the five Centres consists of 28 Professional and 24 General Service posts with another 11 General Service staff funded through general temporary assistance (see A/C.5/45/57, para. 14).

24. As shown in annex III, many ECA headquarters-based substantive divisions provide substantive and technical support to the MULPOCs in the form of reports and studies for meetings of subregional policy organs.

2. Evaluation of MULPOCs

(a) Findings and conclusions

25. In its resolution 43/216, the General Assembly endorsed the concurring recommendations of ACABQ and the United Nations Board of Auditors that the achievements of the MULPOCs be evaluated. In 1988, the Under-Secretary-General for Administration and Management and the Executive Secretary of ECA appointed a team to conduct such an evaluation of the Centres. The Review Team visited all MULPOC offices and 12 selected member States covering all the subregions and interviewed senior level officials of Governments and of intergovernmental organizations and United Nations officials in those countries. The Team also held intensive consultations with the staff and officials of ECA and the MULPOCs on impediments to improving the performance of the Centres and the effectiveness of their programmes.

26. The major findings and conclusions of the Review Team were presented in an Executive Summary and in paragraphs at the end of each chapter of the report (E/ECA/CM.16/13). The points of particular relevance to the evaluation are the following:

(a) The institutional framework of the MULPOCs, especially their policy organs, the respective subregional Councils of Ministers, clearly duplicate those of ECA and the major intergovernmental organizations (para. 4 of the summary and conclusions);

(b) The MULPOCs have not been able to exercise their multinational programming role or provide adequate technical support and advisory services in the subregional development process. They have failed to establish a strong professional presence in the subregion nor do they play any meaningful catalytic role in the economic and social development of the subregions (para. 6 of the summary and conclusions);

(c) One of the greatest institutional handicaps of the MULPOCs is that their available expertise is generally at variance with the established priorities of the member States. The rather top-heavy functional relationship between ECA headquarters and the MULPOCs has considerably eroded and weakened the spirit behind the establishment of the MULPOCs (para. 7 of the summary and conclusions);

(d) Member States are unevenly distributed among the MULPOC subregions. Some of the MULPOCs are just too large, in terms of number of countries and the geographic area to be covered, to provide delivery capacity to the Member States. Some are too small to qualify as a full subregional entity (para. 8 of the summary and conclusions);

(e) The resources made available to the MULPOCs, both human and financial, have been grossly inadequate. This constitutes the single most important obstacle in the fulfilment of their mandate. This scarcity of resources has been aggravated by the withdrawal of UNDP funding of the MULPOCs in 1982, as well as the lack of interest by the donor community. In the assessment of the Review Team, the minimum additional resources required consist of 33 posts at the Professional level and above; 30 General Service and other support staff, and about $US 1 565,100 for non-staff resources (paras. 101-102 of the main text and table 5).

(b) Recommendations of the Review Team

27. On the basis of its assessment, the Review Team proposed the reorientation and strengthening of the activities of the Centres and the improvement of their management. The main recommendations pertinent to the evaluation were (para. 9 of the summary and conclusions):

(a) Immediate action should be taken to transform the MULPOCs into ECA-Subregional Technical Assistance Programmes (ECA/STAPs). New efforts should be made to reorientate the United Nations strategy for subregional cooperation and integration. The ECA-STAPs should also be the sole United Nations agency for providing technical support and advisory services for promotion of subregional cooperation and integration;

(b) The ECA-STAPs should be strengthened and be provided with adequate human and financial resources without which they would hardly operate better than the existing MULPOCs;

(c) In order for the ECA-STAPs to become effective, the ECA should further decentralize some of its operational activities and resources to the new subregional institutions;

(d) The Secretary-General of the United Nations should submit annual reports to the General Assembly on the implementation and follow-up of the recommendations contained in the report.

3. Follow-up actions

28. The Conference of Ministers of ECA assessed the report of the Review Team and submitted its observations on the findings and recommendation of the report in a memorandum submitted to the General Assembly through the Economic and Social Council (Council resolution 1990/76, annex). The Council of Ministers:

(a) Reaffirmed the objectives and purposes of the MULPOCs (para. 5);

(b) Noted that inadequacies in resources have been the major constraint in the ability of the MULPOCs to fulfil their mandate, and stated that ECA's capacity to decentralize staff and resources to the MULPOCs was stretched to the limit (para. 10);

(c) Endorsed the proposal of the Review Team that the financial and human resources of the MULPOCs be significantly increased and they be provided with cost-effective minimal core staff that will enable them to have immediate impact on their respective subregions (para. 11).

29. The Economic and Social Council in resolution 1990/76 took into consideration the recommendations of the Conference of Ministers and urged the General Assembly to provide the Centres with sufficient resources.

30. In a subsequent report on the findings and recommendations of the Review Team, submitted to the General Assembly at its forty-fifth session, the Secretary-General stated:

> The resource constraint has been the nucleus of MULPOC troubles. No matter what structural reorganization of the subregional system is effective, it will not work if the problem of adequate human and financial resources is not at the same time fully addressed. It is, therefore, estimated that MULPOCs, to be able to meet the new responsibilities adequately, would need to be strengthened both under the regular budget and from extrabudgetary resources. As regards the regular budget portion of financing, it has been estimated that the staff resources of the Centres need be increased by eight additional Professional posts and ten General Service posts. (A/C.5/45/57, para. 22).

31. In an oral statement to the Fifth Committee (see A/C.5/45/SR.44 and corrigendum), the Chairman of ACABQ indicated the Advisory Committee's intentions to review the Secretary-General's proposal for additional posts. To facilitate its review, the Chairman stated that the Committee would request a report which clearly indicated the programme of work of the MULPOCs as distinct from the work of the Economic Commission for Africa. The report would also need to provide a breakdown of the various sources of funding for all the posts. In its resolution 45/248, section XI, of 21 December 1990, the General Assembly endorsed the recommendations of the Advisory Committee.

4. Observations on the programmatic implications of these assessments and actions

32. The Lagos Plan of Action envisioned subregional strategies as a framework for joint programmes and the foundation of regional economic cooperation and integration. The importance of subregional economic cooperation has been reaffirmed many times since. But the MULPOCs have failed to establish a strong professional presence in the subregion and they do not play any meaningful catalytic role in the economic and social development of the subregions. That results in a lack of fit between the orientation of the MULPOC work programmes and country-level priorities and strategies. In addition, the objectives and, therefore, expectations of subregional cooperation programmes have been consistently much broader and more ambitious than resource availability could support, which has undermined the effectiveness and sustainability of the MULPOCs in the past.

33. If the scope of the activities of the subregional centres does not change substantially, then, even if the additional resources proposed in the report of the Secretary-General referred to in paragraph 30 above are adopted, the new ECA-STAPs are in danger of suffering from the same mismatch as the old MULPOCs between the intended scope of the Centres' activities and the resources available to them. The lack of fit between the national priorities and subregional strategies of the MULPOCs is also likely to continue.

34. The Review Team and the Conference of Ministers of ECA supported the continuation of the five subregional Centres. This raises three basic issues. First, is there a minimum staffing level required to operate an effective subregional office with substantive responsibilities? Second, what should be the distribution of functions between the subregional offices and the central office at ECA headquarters, and to what extent can the staff resources of ECA be decentralized to subregional offices? Third, what sources of funding are needed for the support of the Centres?

35. A comparison of staffing levels for subregional offices of ECA and the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) is, even with all the qualifications that such comparisons between institutions in different regions necessarily require, still suggestive of the minimum staffing level of substainable subregional offices. As shown in table 1 the staffing level of the smaller of the two principal subregional offices in ECLAC that conduct substantive activities is on average about three times that of the largest of the MULPOCs.

36. The relative decentralization that sustainable subregional offices require can also be suggested by the comparison between ECLAC and ECA in table 2. In ECLAC, about 26 per cent of the Commission's regular budget posts are at offices outside of headquarters, compared to about 10 per cent for ECA.

Table 1. Staffing of subregional offices with substantive activities, ECLAC and ECA, 1990-1991

	Professional	Local level	Total
ECLAC:			
Mexico City	25	51	76
Port of Spain	16	24	40
Other offices a/	9	12	21
	50	87	137
ECA: MULPOCS based in			
Gisenyi	5	2	7
Lusaka	5	8	13
Niamey	8	5	13
Tangiers	4	5	9
Yaounde	6	4	10
	28	24	52

Source: A/44/6/Rev.1 and A/C.5/45/57. In addition to the posts shown for the MULPOCs, general temporary assistance funds are being used to finance the equivalent of 11 local level posts: 5 in Niamey, 2 in Gisenyi and 4 in Yaounde.

a/ Offices with liaison functions: Bogotá, Brasilia, Buenos Aires, Montevideo and Washington, D.C.

Table 2. Distribution of regular budget posts in central and and subregional offices: ECLAC and ECA, 1990-1991

		Professional	Local level	Total
ECLAC:	Santiago	126	258	384
	Subregional offices	50	87	137
		176	345	521
	Subregional as percentage of total	28.4	25.2	26.3
ECA:	Addis Ababa	182	350	532
	MULPOCs	28	24	52
		210	374	584
	Proposed additions to MULPOCs	8	10	18
		218	384	602
	MULPOCs as percentage of total:			
	(a) Current appropriation	13.3	6.9	9.8
	(b) With proposed additions	16.5	8.9	11.6
	Memoranda items:			
	Staffing level proposed by Review Team	64	74	138
	MULPOCs as percentage of total with this level of staffing and no decentralization of current staff in Addis Ababa	26.0	17.5	17.9

Source: A/44/6/Rev.1, section 12, annex I, and section 13, table 13.5; A/C.5/45/57 (MULPOCs); and E/ECA/CM.16/13, table 4 (Review Team).

37. If the resource levels of the MULPOCs proposed at the forty-fifth session of the General Assembly were approved, ECA would still only have less than 12 per cent of its authorized regular budget posts decentralized. The staffing level proposed by the Review Team would, with no decentralization of staff currently at ECA headquarters, bring the proportion of ECA staff outside headquarters closer to the ECLAC level. It is likely that such a level of additional resources would have to be achieved through increased extrabudgetary funds to support operational activities of the Centres, perhaps combined with some decentralization of staff currently at ECA headquarters. Annex I indicates that there may be some scope for decentralization at Addis Ababa.

38. In planning the future work programme of the Centres, it will be important (a) to define the minimal critical size of each Centre and (b) to determine realistically the extent of any possible decentralization of the existing functions

in Addis Ababa and the outlook for extrabudgetary funds before final decisions are taken on the programmes of the Centres or on additional posts needed from the regular budget.

B. Collection, management and dissemination of development information

1. Scope and objectives of PADIS

39. The collection of development information, primarily statistical and bibliographic data, is an essential prerequisite for analysis and evaluation of socio-economic trends and an important part of the mandate of the Commission. ECA first established PADIS in 1980 as an extrabudgetary project funded by UNDP.

40. Subprogrammes seven and eight of PADIS were added in 1984 as revisions to the medium-term plan for the period 1984-1989 (extended to 1991) to enhance the Commission's capacity to coordinate the collection and management of development information.

41. The overall objectives of PADIS, as elaborated in the development information component of the ECA subprogramme on development issues and policies, is to establish a regional information system in Africa that will serve as a conduit for information and data on development information centered around national, subregional and regional networks, to which all member States will contribute voluntarily in order to share their management information experiences. The past three biennial programme budgets, covering the period 1986-1991, did not directly appropriate regular budget resources for activities under subprogrammes seven and eight. UNDP conceived and extended the project in three successive phases. The third phase of the project came to an end in 31 December 1990. In the third phase of the project UNDP anticipated that the regular budget of the Commission would assume some of the costs of the Central Coordination Office of PADIS. The 1990-1991 regular budget of the Commission, however, only made provision for the post of chief of computer services in the administration and common services of the ECA secretariat. At the end of 1990, therefore, there was neither a firm commitment on the part of UNDP to extend funding of the project nor were provisions made in the regular budget for financing the continuation of support activities.

2. UNDP evaluation of PADIS

(a) Observations and findings

42. In order to decide on the future funding and orientation of its support UNDP conducted an evaluation of the PADIS project (RAF/86/053) in 1990. The observations and findings of the evaluation mission pertinent to the main activities and outputs of the project are summarized below:

(a) The objectives proposed in the project document are commensurate with the inputs provided, and the resulting outputs have significantly improved access to available information (para. A.4.3.1);

(b) The creation of a development information system and network for Africa, which PADIS is assigned to address, still remains an important and worthy objective meriting the support of the international donor community (finding 1);

(c) The need for and usefulness of the activities under Project RAF/86/053, PADIS III, are recognized and expressed as such by the member States (finding 2);

(d) In working towards meeting the objectives of the project, in implementing the activities directed at the realization of these objectives and in producing the related outputs, UNDP resources have been used in a useful way and in accordance with the conditions as mentioned in the project document (finding 3);

(e) Starting from a meagre basis, PADIS III has shown remarkable progress in all fields related to its immediate objectives (growth in number of national participating centers, increase in number of data banks, increase in contents of data banks, increased use of products and services, training, advisory services and servicing of meetings provided) (finding 37);

(f) Decision makers and planners seem largely oriented towards numerical data, most of which are acquired at the national level. Information sought from external sources mainly pertains to macroeconomic, sectoral and project related data at the subregional level and to data facilitating comparative intercountry analysis (finding 14);

(g) The use of databases has been less than optimal: (i) the databases and the publications derived from them are not known to many of the intended users (paras. C.1.4.1 to C.1.4.4); (ii) requests for on-line database searches have also been handicapped by the state of the communications in the continent (para. C.1.3.1); (iii) there is persistent lack of knowledge of actual and potential users and their respective needs (para. A.3). There exists substantial mismatch between the main targeted user group (decision makers and planners) and the actual user group (researchers) (finding 13); and (iv) in addition, confusion as to what development information is or should be is widespread (finding 15);

(h) The subregional centres have not become operational because of difficulties in the funding of the components the host Governments agreed to finance (finding 40);

(i) Developments in information technology have rendered the need for subregional centres as collection and processing nodes redundant (finding 41);

(j) Provided adequate resources are made available, subregional centres can play a useful role in bringing PADIS closer to the field and in decentralized efforts in the fields of sensitization, training and advisory services (finding 42).

(b) Recommendations

43. In the light of its findings, the evaluation mission made the following four major recommendations:

(a) PADIS should redesign the project in the next phase to reflect the expressed need for meeting specific development information requirements of planners, policy makers and decision makers in the member States;

(b) PADIS should take immediate steps to identify its target audience;

(c) Funding for PADIS should be continued through the UNDP Fifth Cycle (1991-1996), and that it be integrated into the ECA organizational structure;

(d) Member States should honour the obligations they choose to engage in and strive more vigorously for the implementation of the resolutions passed on their behalf.

4. Follow-up actions

44. The Administrator of UNDP decided that the project should be continued through 1991 and that savings from the project should be utilized for that purpose. Future financing, however, would be decided in a tripartite meeting, to be held in May 1991, of UNDP, ECA and representatives of participating Governments. UNDP has advised ECA to shift part of the costs of the administrative and support services to the regular budget of the Commission, and has indicated that it does not envision funds for subregional centres that are not already in existence.

5. Observations on programmatic implications

45. The review of the PADIS project raises two programmatic issues of general relevance:

(a) There is a strong relationship of mutual dependence between activities funded from the extrabudgetary sources and those funded from the regular budget. In the case of PADIS, the project included some activities of the type that are normally funded by the regular budget that were justified as support and administrative costs of the project activities. Some of these support and administrative costs are now being shifted to the regular budget;

(b) The subregional activities were problematical; they had not become operational due to difficulties in funding government components, and developments in technology have made subregional centres unnecessary for collection or processing of information.

C. Contributions of the programme to regional economic cooperation and to international responses to the recurrent economic and social crisis

46. The contribution of the programme on economic cooperation and integration and on development of information systems has largely been covered in the assessment of the subprogrammes on the MULPOCs and PADIS. In addition, the programme on development issues and policies is central to those aspects of the ECA mandate and terms of reference which concern the facilitation of regional economic cooperation through analysis and assessment of socio-economic trends in support of the deliberations of the ECA Conference of Ministers. With regard to those other areas covered by the programme, in-depth analyses of the trends and policy requirements of socio-economic development in the region have continued to be provided. There is now increased awareness among policy makers of development planning needs and objectives, as well as of the instruments that are required for successful implementation. Assistance continues to be provided to countries on economic modelling and the establishment of short-term forecasting systems. Special efforts have been made to link activities in these areas with the activities in capacity-building of training institutions in macroeconomic policies and long-term planning such as those carried out at the Institute of Economic Development and Planning (IDEP).

47. The programme also continues to provide a useful forum for discussion of the special problems and needs of the group of least developed, land-locked and island developing countries to formulate common positions on international issues of concern to them. In human resources, many important initiatives have been undertaken in recent years. Through the Conference of Vice-Chancellors, Presidents and Rectors of Institutions for Higher Learning in Africa, the role of higher education in development has been better defined and has led to a number of national and regional programmes aimed at making higher education more relevant to development. Many studies have also been undertaken on problems of human resources that have strengthened the information base for policy formulation in the field of human resources. Major international conferences on the Human Dimension of African Economic Recovery and Development and on Popular Participation have helped to significantly change thinking on development by promoting the new widely accepted notion of human centred and democratized development approach in Africa.

48. With the recurrence of the economic and social crisis, the collection and analysis of information on social and economic trends and policies have also become linked with the preparation of analysis and assessments for use in the deliberations of the Economic and Social Council and the General Assembly. The findings and assessments conducted within regular activities of the ECA programme on development issues and policies were important inputs to the analysis and conclusions arrived at and incorporated in the United Nations Programme of Action. Since its adoption, the secretariat of ECA has completed an evaluation of structural adjustment programmes, which has been supported by major donors and some multilateral development institutions. This study became the basis of a broad policy statement, the African Alternative Framework to Structural Adjustment Programmes for Socio-Economic Recovery and Transformation (A/44/315, annex) by the Conference of Ministers and Heads of States and Governments of OAU. The statement

was submitted to and endorsed by the General Assembly in resolution 43/27 of 18 November 1988. The Assembly further called upon the international community to use the Alternative Framework as a basis for dialogue on adjustment.

III. EFFECTS OF EXTRABUDGETARY RESOURCES ON PRIORITIES AMONG ECA PROGRAMMES

A. Priorities among ECA programmes

49. The United Nations Programme of Action contains an authoritative consensus statement of priorities, to which the ECA member States have agreed and which the international community has accepted as the basis of support to national, subregional and regional programmes of technical co-operation for development. It assigns the highest level of priority to agricultural development, other sectors in support of agriculture, drought and desertification, human resources development, planning and utilization and policy reforms through improved management of the economy, public policies and structural adjustment measures and programmes. At the subregional level, the priorities re-emphasize agricultural development and drought and desertification measures and programmes, especially those States in the Sahel and members of the Intergovernmental Authority for Drought and Development. At the regional level, the Programme reaffirmed the need for strengthening the institutional framework through improved management and rationalization of the activities of African development institutions and the elimination of duplication of efforts.

50. In the context of the medium-term plan for the period 1992-1997 on regional development cooperation for Africa, the General Assembly endorsed, in resolution 45/253, section I, paragraph 1, the recommendations of CPC that high priority should be assigned to human resource development in the context of development issues and policies (subprogramme 1), agricultural and rural development (subprogramme 2), industrial development (subprogramme 10), energy (subprogramme 14), and transport, communications and tourism (subprogramme 17) and the new subprogramme on economic cooperation and integration proposed by CPC in paragraph 263 (c) of its report.

B. Methodologies for assessing the effects of extrabudgetary funds on priorities

51. The medium-term plan for the period 1976-1979 contained an extensive analysis of growth and changing priorities in the United Nations budget. 6/ It reviewed issues of definition, trends in overall growth, and in programme and non-programme expenditure. The measures used for analysis were percentage shares in resources among programmes, and real growth for both regular budget and extrabudgetary funds, with the rankings of programmes with respect to these measures used as indicators of priority.

52. Three lessons for planning were drawn from that analysis:

(a) Half of the resources allocated to United Nations programmes are allocated through mechanisms over which the General Assembly has limited influence;

(b) Those extrabudgetary resources are capable of more rapid change from year to year than the regular budget's funds;

(c) If the General Assembly wished to set overall priorities it would be necessary to anticipate the future trends in extrabudgetary resources, and take these into account in allocating regular budget funds.

53. A similar analysis and the same conclusions were presented in the medium-term plan for the period 1978-1981. 7/

54. The role of extrabudgetary funds in the budgets of United Nations organizations has been the subject of numerous analyses since these early efforts, the latest being a report of the Joint Inspection Unit, entitled "Extrabudgetary resources of the United Nations: towards transparency of presentation, management and reporting" (see A/45/797). That report, although focused on other matters, contained part of one chapter on the distribution of extrabudgetary resources and their impact on priorities.

55. The analyses that follow utilize methodologies similar to those used in the reports cited above.

C. Significance of extrabudgetary funds in ECA

56. In absolute terms for the biennium 1988-1989, ECA attracted the second largest volume of extrabudgetary (XB) funds of the regional commissions, ECLAC having the largest volume. ECA's XB supplement to its regular budget (RB) resources was also considerably smaller than ESCAP, about the same as ECLAC and much larger than ECE and ESCWA.

Table 3. Proportion of extrabudgetary resources in the regional commissions total budgets, 1988-1989

Budget section	Commission	Percentage of XB
10	ECE	10.6
11	ESCAP	52.2
12	ECLAC	36.2
13	ECA	35.3
14	ESCWA	12.2

Source: A/44/6/Rev.1; RB, appropriations; XB, estimated expenditures.

57. Direct allocations of RB and XB funds to programmes are given in annexes II and III, which also show the rankings of each programme in terms of RB and XB funds for the biennia 1986-1987 and 1988-1989. These annexes also show percentage resource growth of 1988-1989 over 1986-1987 by programme and rankings with respect to this measure.

58. The five largest and five smallest programmes in terms of RB and XB allocations in 1986-1987 and 1988-1989 are shown in table 4. Two general features of the role of direct resource allocations to programmes in ECA are clear from this information:

(a) RB allocations are relatively stable. The largest five programmes remained the same in both biennia, as did the smallest five programmes. Overall, 8 out of 16 programmes did not change rank;

(b) XB allocations are more volatile than RB. Even here, however, the five largest programmes remained the same in both biennia, and six programmes did not change rank. However, the range of positive and negative growth was much greater for XB than RB.

Table 4. Comparison of regular budget and extrabudgetary allocations to programmes, 1986-1987 and 1988-1989 biennia

A. Five programmes with the greatest resources

Regular budget	Rank a/	Extrabudgetary funds	Rank a/
Development issues and policies	1, 1	Development issues and policies	1, 1
Industrial development	2, 2	Population	2, 2
International trade	3, 4	Food and agriculture	3, 5
Statistics	4, 5	Transport	4, 4
Transport	5, 3	Statistics	5, 3

B. Five programmes with the least resources

Regular budget	Rank a/	Extrabudgetary funds	Rank a/
Human settlements	12, 13	International trade	12, 11
Transnational corporations	13, 15	Human settlements	13, 14
Energy	14, 14	Environment	14, 10
Environment	15, 12	Marine affairs	15, 15
Marine affairs	16, 16	Transnational corporations	16, 16

Source: Annexes II and III.

a/ Respective ranks in programme resources for 1986-1987 and 1988-1989.

D. Effect of extrabudgetary funds on priorities

59. There is no single measure of the importance of XB funds on programme priorities. Three important measures illustrated in table 5 are: (a) the proportion of XB funds in a programme's total resources; (b) the direction and volume of growth in XB funds in comparison with RB funds; and (c) the stability of this supplementary funding.

Table 5. Measures of the effect of extrabudgetary funds on priorities, 1986-1987 and 1988-1989

Rank in terms of RB 1986-1987	Programme of activities	XB as proportion of RB 1988-1989 (percentage)	Growth, 1988-1989 over 1986-1987 RB (percentage)	Growth, 1988-1989 over 1986-1987 XB (percentage)	Stable and large XB support?
1	Food and agriculture	117	10.6	31.8	Yes
2	Industrial development	101	2.8	48.3	Yes
3	International trade and development finance	19	-4.9	-50.2	
4	Statistics	216	-2.2	25.5	Yes
5	Transport, Communications and Tourism	159	16.4	5.6	Yes
6	Social development	173	5.5	-7.3	Yes
7	Food and agriculture	208	10.2	-5.6	Yes
8	Natural resources	16	22.6	-80.8	
9	Population	537	12.2	19.8	Yes
10	Public administration and finance	84	1.8	-62.7	
11	Science and technology	304	24.8	95.1	Yes
12	Human settlements	48	-23.3	-56.8	
13	Transnational corporations	-	-34.1	-	
14	Energy and development	87	-8.3	-63.2	
15	Environment	154	63.5	110.9	Yes
16	Marine affairs	a/	a/	a/	a/

Source: Annexes II and III.

a/ RB funding of $10,100 in 1988-1989; XB zero in 1986-1987, $202,900 in 1988-1989.

60. It is clear from table 5 that for eight of ECA's 16 programmes extrabudgetary sources are the predominant form of funding, and for 12 out of the 16 programmes XB funding is of great significance. In only two of these cases, energy and public administration, has this funding shown a significant decline in 1988-1989 compared to 1986-1987.

61. It is possible to construct analytical measures from the data in annexes II and III that can serve as rough indicators of the impact of XB funds on resource allocations to programmes. One such measure can be constructed by comparing a programme's rank in terms of the allocation of RB resources with its rank in terms of total resources available to it after XB funds are added. This measure, shown in table 6, indicates that the effect of XB resources is to upgrade significantly the relative importance of the programmes on population, science and technology and

food and agriculture and significantly downgrade those on international trade and finance, industrial development and national resources.

Table 6. Impact of extrabudgetary funds on resource allocations to programmes, 1988-1989

Rank in terms of RB resources, 1986-1987	Programme of activity	Rank in terms of resource allocations, 1988-1989			Difference in rank: RB minus total resources
		XB	RB	Total resources	
1	Development issues and policies	1	1	1	-
2	Industrial development	2	7	6	-4
3	International trade and development finance	4	11	9	-5
4	Statistics	5	3	4	1
5	Transport, communications and tourism	3	4	3	-
6	Social development	8	6	7	1
7	Food and agriculture	7	5	5	2
8	Natural resources	6	13	10	-4
9	Population	9	2	2	7
10	Public administration and finance	10	9	11	-1
11	Science and technology	11	8	8	3
12	Human settlements	13	14	14	-1
13	Transnational corporations	15	16	15	-
14	Energy and development	14	12	13	1
15	Environment	12	10	12	-
16	Marine affairs	16	15	16	-

Source: Annexes I and II.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

62. CPC is invited to endorse the following propositions, stemming from the findings and recommendations summarized in this report, as a basis for improving the contributions of the ECA programme on development issues and policies to strengthening subregional cooperation in Africa:

(a) Improvements in the performance and effectiveness of the MULPOCs will require a substantial increase in resources in order to enable each of the Centres to be of a viable size;

(b) The increased resources should be part of new efforts to reorient the ECA strategy for subregional cooperation and integration. The process of reorientation should start with an examination of the possibilities for decentralizing the activities and resources of all ECA programmes with subregional activities. Headquarter's activities of ECA could be more effectively focused on strategic central functions, including collection and dissemination of statistics;

(c) To be effective and sustainable, activities in support of subregional cooperation must be closely coordinated with country priorities and strategies.

63. Using these propositions as a framework:

(a) ECA should identify those subprogrammes that should be reoriented and focused wholly on subregional objectives;

(b) A revision of the medium-term plan for the period 1992-1997 should be prepared to reflect the full scope of activities in support of subregional cooperation, and submitted in 1992 in the context of the first revision of the plan, through the ECA Conference of Ministers and CPC, to the Economic and Social Council and the General Assembly;

(c) The proposed revisions should contain indications of the resources required for both existing and additional activities with subregional components.

Notes

1/ Official Records of the General Assembly, Forty-second Session, Supplement No. 16 (A/42/16), part one, para. 239.

2/ Ibid., Forty-fourth Session, Supplement No. 16 (A/44/16), para. 294.

3/ Ibid., Forty-third Session, Supplement No. 5 (A/43/5), vol. I, paras. 88-91 and 177-180.

4/ Ibid., Forty-fifth Session, Supplement No. 16 (A/45/16), part one, paras. 368 and 369.

5/ Ibid., para. 263 (a).

Notes (continued)

6/ Ibid., Thirtieth Session, Supplement No. 6A (A/10006/Add.1), part I, sect. I.

7/ Ibid., Thirty-first Session, Supplement No. 6A (A/31/6/Add.1), vol. II, chap. I, paras. 5-11.

ANNEX I

Substantive support of MULPOCs in the 1990-1991 work programme of ECA

Programme of activity	Programme elements in the 1990-1991 work programme with outputs citing outputs for MULPOCs as primary users
Executive direction and management	[1.2; MULPOCs not primary user]
Food and agriculture	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 1.4, 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 2.4, 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, 3.4
Marine affairs	NIL
Development issues and policies	4.2, 4.3
Environment	NIL
Human settlements	NIL
Industrial development	1.1, 2.2, 2.3, 3.1, 3.2, 4.1
International trade and development finance	NIL
Transnational corporations	NIL
Natural resources	2.1
Energy and development	1.2, 1.3
Population	NIL
Public administration and finance	NIL
Science and technology	NIL
Social development	1.1
Statistics	NIL
Transport, communications and tourism	1.1, 2.3

Source: A/44/6/Rev.1, sect. 13.

ANNEX II

Regular budget resources of ECA: final appropriation to programmes, 1986-1987 and 1988-1989

Programme of activity	1986-1987 Thousands of US dollars	Rank	1988-1989 Thousands of US dollars	Rank	Percentage of growth	Rank
Development issues and policies	7 941.0	1	8 781.9	1	10.6	6
Industrial development	2 394.3	2	2 462.2	2	2.8	8
International trade and development finance	2 321.1	3	2 206.3	4	-4.9	11
Statistics	2 015.7	4	1 971.7	5	-2.2	10
Transport, communications and tourism	2 000.8	5	2 328.8	3	16.4	4
Social development	1 538.3	6	1 454.1	8	-5.5	12
Food and agriculture	1 484.8	7	1 636.2	7	10.2	7
Natural resources	1 482.7	8	1 818.1	6	22.6	3
Population	952.3	9	1 068.2	9	12.2	5
Public administration and finance	822.1	10	836.9	10	1.8	9
Science and technology	601.5	11	750.7	11	24.8	2
Human settlements	556.1	12	426.6	13	-23.3	14
Transnational corporations	525.0	13	346.2	15	-34.1	15
Energy and development	444.4	14	407.6	14	-8.3	13
Environment	262.6	15	429.4	12	63.5	1
Marine affairs	107.7	16	10.2	16	-90.5	16

Source: Programme Planning and Budget Division, final budget appropriations, projected expenditure performance and expenses for the biennium 1986-1987, memorandum to heads of departments and offices dated 6 June 1988; final budget appropriations and expenses for the biennium 1988-1989, memorandum dated 30 April 1990. The figure for the programme on transnational corporations is from section 9 of the programme budget for the biennium; all other figures are for section 13 (ECA).

ANNEX III

Extrabudgetary resources of ECA: direct allocations to programmes, 1986-1987 and 1988-1989

Programme of activity	1986-1987 Thousands of US dollars	Rank	1988-1989 Thousands of US dollars	Rank	Percentage of growth	Rank
Development issues and policies	7 800.8	1	10 283.3	1	31.8	5
Population	4 789.9	2	5 738.7	2	19.8	7
Food and agriculture	3 609.7	3	3 408.9	5	-5.6	9
Transport, communications and tourism	3 507.2	4	3 702.5	4	5.6	8
Statistics	3 228.9	5	4 035.0	3	25.5	6
Social development	2 705.3	6	2 507.8	6	-7.3	10
Public administration and finance	1 879.2	7	700.7	9	-62.7	13
Industrial development	1 682.0	8	2 494.0	7	48.3	4
Natural resources	1 544.4	9	296.8	13	-80.8	15
Science and technology	1 170.2	10	2 282.9	8	95.1	3
Energy and development	967.7	11	356.4	12	-63.2	14
International trade and development, finance	845.8	12	421.2	11	-50.2	11
Human settlements	476.0	13	205.5	14	-56.8	12
Environment	313.8	14	661.9	10	110.9	2
Marine affairs	--	15	202.9	15	n.a.	1
Transnational corporations	--	16	--	16	--	16

Source: Tables 4.2 and 4.3, Biennial report of the Executive Secretary, 1988-1989, Economic Commission for Africa (E/ECA/CM.16/2); plus allocations to programmes in table 1 for all sources except sections 13 (ECA) and 9 (Transnationals).

UNITED
NATIONS

E

Economic and Social Council

Distr.
GENERAL

E/AC.51/1991/3/Corr.1
30 April 1991

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

COMMITTEE FOR PROGRAMME AND COORDINATION
Thirty-first session
13 May-7 June 1991
Item 3 (d) of the provisional agenda*

PROGRAMME QUESTIONS: EVALUATION

In-depth evaluation of the development issues and policies programme: Economic Commission for Africa

Final report of the Secretary-General

Corrigendum

1. Paragraph 24, line 1

   For As shown in annex III read As shown in annex I

2. Replace table 6 by the table shown on the reverse of this page.

---

* E/AC.51/1991/1.

Table 6. Impact of extrabudgetary funds on resource allocations to programmes, 1988-1989

Rank in terms of RB resources, 1986-1987	Programme of activity	Rank in terms of resource allocations, 1988-1989			Difference in rank (RB minus total resources)
		RB	XB	Total resources	
1	Development issues and policies	1	1	1	-
2	Industrial development	2	7	6	-4
3	International trade and development finance	4	11	9	-5
4	Statistics	5	3	4	1
5	Transport, communications and tourism	3	4	3	-
6	Social development	8	6	7	1
7	Food and agriculture	7	5	5	2
8	Natural resources	6	13	10	-4
9	Population	9	2	2	7
10	Public administration and finance	10	9	11	-1
11	Science and technology	11	8	8	3
12	Human settlements	13	14	14	-1
13	Transnational corporations	15	16	15	-
14	Energy and development	14	12	13	1
15	Environment	12	10	12	-
16	Marine affairs	16	15	16	-

Source: Annexes II and III.

UNITED
NATIONS

E

Economic and Social Council

Distr.
GENERAL

E/AC.51/1991/4
9 April 1991

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

COMMITTEE FOR PROGRAMME AND COORDINATION
Thirty-first session
13 May-7 June 1991
Item 3 (d) of the provisional agenda*

PROGRAMME QUESTIONS: EVALUATION

In-depth evaluation of the programme on the international protection of and assistance to refugees: Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

Progress report of the Secretary-General

SUMMARY

The Committee for Programme and Coordination (CPC), at its twenty-ninth session, recommended that an in-depth evaluation of the programme on international protection of and assistance to refugees be prepared for its consideration in 1993. Following established practice, this progress report contains preliminary findings as well as proposals on the scope and methodology of the evaluation and the issues to be addressed.

The report recommends that the final in-depth evaluation focus on the following topics: the mandate of UNHCR; coordination and early warning; training; issues of intergovernmental concern in refugee assistance; dissemination activities; coverage of UNHCR in the world press; and the annual financial cycle.

* E/AC.51/1991/1.

CONTENTS

	Paragraphs	Page
INTRODUCTION	1 - 3	3
I. BACKGROUND AND BASIC CHARACTERISTICS OF THE UNHCR PROGRAMME	4 - 22	3
A. General description	4 - 11	3
B. Medium-term plan	12 - 16	5
C. Resources	17 - 22	7
II. PRELIMINARY FINDINGS ON THE PROGRAMME	23 - 61	10
A. Observations on the programme as a whole	23 - 28	10
B. Protection (subprogrammes 1 to 3)	29 - 51	12
1. General issues	29 - 32	12
2. Treaties	33 - 37	14
3. Promotion, dissemination and training	38	15
4. Protection of refugee women and children	39 - 41	16
5. Coordination issues related to early warning	42 - 46	17
6. Views expressed in the professional literature	47 - 51	19
C. Durable solutions and material assistance	52 - 61	20
1. Nature of durable solutions and assistance	52	20
2. Allocation of resources	53 - 55	21
3. Intergovernmental concerns	56	23
4. UNHCR evaluations	57	24
5. Views expressed in the professional literature	58 - 61	24
III. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE IN-DEPTH EVALUATION	62 - 66	25

Annexes

I. Bibliography of the professional literature consulted	30
II. UNHCR evaluation reports, 1984-1989	35

/...

INTRODUCTION

1. The Committee for Programme and Coordination (CPC), at its twenty-ninth session, recommended that an in-depth evaluation of the programme on international protection of and assistance to refugees be prepared for its consideration in 1993. 1/ The General Assembly, in its resolution 44/194 of 21 December 1989 (sect. IV, para. 1), approved the recommendation of CPC.

2. At its thirtieth session, the Committee had before it a note by the Secretary-General (E/AC.51/1991/7), in which it was stated that chapter 8 of the medium-term plan for the period 1984-1989 consisted of the activities of both the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) and the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA). The Secretary-General considered that, in view of the size and complexity of the two organizations, and taking into account recent developments, the focus of the evaluation should be on UNHCR. CPC took note of the report, on the understanding that the progress report on the evaluation of UNRWA would be submitted to it in 1993, at which time a decision on the final report on UNWRA would be taken. 2/

3. Following established practice, the evaluation of the programme on international protection of and assistance to refugees which, at this phase is limited to the activities of UNHCR, is being carried out in two stages. The present, first stage is a progress report containing proposals on the scope and methodology of the evaluation and the issues to be addressed as well as, in accordance with the recommendation of CPC at its twenty-seventh session, "such preliminary findings as can be derived from information already available". 3/ The in-depth evaluation of the programme of UNHCR will be before the Committee in 1993.

I. BACKGROUND AND BASIC CHARACTERISTICS OF THE UNHCR PROGRAMME

A. General description

4. Concern by international organizations for the legal and material welfare of refugees and displaced persons has been in the forefront throughout much of the twentieth century. Identifiable institutional structures to deal with the problem pre-date the United Nations. In fact, from 1921 onward until the onset of the Second World War, a series of international organizations were established under the auspices of the League of Nations to deal with the problems of refugees.

5. The enormous destruction and dislocation wrought by the Second World War, especially in Europe, made concern for refugees and displaced persons an early one for the newly created United Nations. The very first session of the General Assembly adopted a resolution (A/48 of 12 February 1946), in which it stressed that no refugee or displaced person who had expressed valid objections to returning to his country of origin should be compelled to do so.

6. After a succession of temporary refugee organizations, notably among them the United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration (UNRRA) and subsequently the International Refugee Organization (IRO), the General Assembly, by resolution 319 (IV) of 3 December 1949, established the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) as of 1 January 1951. The Office was initially set up for a period of three years. After the expiry of the first three years, its mandate was renewed for five years (Assembly resolution 727 (VIII) of 23 October 1953) and since then it was extended at regular five-year intervals, with the latest extension expiring on 31 December 1993 (resolution 42/108 of 7 December 1987). Taking account of the fact that protection of and assistance to refugees has evolved into one of the most important humanitarian endeavours of the United Nations and that international cooperation in solving international problems of an economic, social, cultural, or humanitarian character is one of the purposes of the Organization as laid down in the Charter (Art. 1 (3)), the continuing non-permanent status of UNHCR is somewhat of an anomaly.

7. The statute of the Office of the High Commissioner was adopted by the General Assembly on 14 December 1950 and is contained in the annex to its resolution 428 (V). It characterized the Office, in paragraph 2, as follows:

> The work of the High Commissioner shall be of an entirely non-political character, it shall be humanitarian and social and shall relate, as a rule, to groups and categories of refugees.

8. The statute also provided in paragraph 6, a definition of the term "refugee", which was incorporated into the Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees 4/ and subsequently modified in the Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees of 31 January 1967. 5/ As modified and currently applied, a refugee is defined as:

> Any person who, owing to well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or public opinion, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country; or who, not having a nationality and being outside the country of his former habitual residence as a result of such events, is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to return to it.

9. Over the years, and in response to resolutions adopted by the General Assembly and the Economic and Social Council, UNHCR has also been extending assistance to persons who do not fall under the strict definition of "refugee" cited in paragraph 8 above. In fact, it has increasingly been called upon to provide material assistance to and use its good offices for uprooted and displaced persons, both inside and outside of their country of origin, who have found themselves in refugee-like situations. Assistance to those persons is usually extended on a group, rather than an individual, basis, partly because individual determination of refugee status may prove to be, for one reason or another, impractical but mainly because of the urgency of the situation.

10. The High Commissioner, who is responsible for the work of the Office of UNHCR, is elected by the General Assembly on the nomination of the Secretary-General. The current High Commissioner, the eighth since the inception of UNHCR, is Mrs. Sadako Ogata of Japan, who was elected by the General Assembly on 21 December 1990 for a period of three years beginning on 1 January 1991 (decision 45/319).

11. The work of UNHCR is reviewed annually by the General Assembly, which provides UNHCR with policy directives and receives from the High Commissioner, through the Economic and Social Council, a comprehensive annual report. The report is usually transmitted by the Council to the Assembly without debate; in the Assembly, the report is assigned for close scrutiny and debate to the Third Committee. The High Commissioner also reports annually to the Executive Committee of the High Commissioner's Programme, an intergovernmental body of 44 members, which advises the High Commissioner on the exercise of his statutory functions and approves the financial targets needed for the implementation of the UNHCR General Programmes so they can meet the needs of the refugees in terms of protection and material assistance.

B. Medium-term plan

12. The overall mandate of the Office of the UNHCR is set out in paragraph 1 of its statute:

> The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, acting under the authority of the General Assembly, shall assume the function of providing international protection under the auspices of the United Nations, to refugees who fall within the scope of the present Statute and of seeking permanent solutions for the problem of refugees by assisting Governments and, subject to the approval of the Governments concerned, private organizations to facilitate the voluntary repatriation of such refugees, or their assimilation within new national communities.

13. The medium-term plan for the period 1984-1989 (extended to 1991), 6/ which provides the programmatic framework for the evaluation of UNHCR, reflects the Office's two main functions, i.e. provision of international protection to refugees and search for durable solutions to refugee problems, in its subprogramme structure. In addition, as the general orientation of the major programme on refugees notes (para. 8.3), the Office's material assistance programme has, at the request of the General Assembly and the Governments concerned, been substantially expanded to provide urgent relief assistance in the initial stage of a refugee influx.

14. The increasing importance assumed by the provision of emergency humanitarian assistance - necessitated by large-scale movements of refugees and displaced persons worldwide - has imparted an immediacy to the activities of UNHCR, which is certainly in keeping with its humanitarian character, as stipulated in paragraph 2 of its statute. At the same time, it has also created a duality of fuctions for UNHCR, one of which (provision of protection

and search for durable solutions) is continuous, while the other (emergency assistance) is more ad hoc and unpredictable and, therefore, less liable to advance planning on a medium-term, or even on a short-term, horizon.

15. The programme of UNHCR, as set out in the medium-term plan for the period 1984-1989 (extended to 1991), consists of 7 subprogrammes, which have been further broken down into 13 programme elements in the programme budgets for the bienniums 1986-1987 and 1988-1989 as follows:

Subprogramme 1 International protection: international instruments relating to the status of refugees or otherwise benefiting refugees

Programme element 1	Promotion of accession to existing instruments
Programme element 2	Elaboration of new international instruments and additional treaty provisions for the benefit of refugees

Subprogramme 2 International protection: effective implementation of refugee rights

Programme element 1	Refugee rights
Programme element 2	National legislation
Programme element 3	Implementation of refugee rights

Subprogramme 3 International protection: promotion and dissemination of principles of refugee law

Programme element 1	Promotion of refugee law
Programme element 2	Dissemination of refugee law

Subprogramme 4 Material assistance: voluntary repatriation

Programme element 1	Promotion and identification of voluntary repatriation possibilities
Programme element 2	Transportation and reinstallation (reintegration) of refugees in their country of origin

Subprogramme 5 Material assistance: provision for self-support

Programme element 1	Identification and programming of self-support needs and activities
Programme element 2	Implementation of self-support activities

Subprogramme 6 Material assistance: promotion of resettlement

Programme element 1 Identification and establishment of resettlement opportunities

Programme element 2 Processing of resettlement operations

Subprogramme 7 Special humanitarian operations

16. Despite the fact that the medium-term plan for the period 1984-1989 (extended to 1991) has been revised three times since its inception (in 1984, 1986 and 1988), no revision has been made of the refugee programme.

C. Resources

17. Expenditures of UNHCR for the period 1984-1989 are shown in table 1.

Table 1. UNHCR expenditures by sources of funds, 1984-1989

	1984-1985		1986-1987		1988-1989	
	$ Million	Per-centage	$ Million	Per-centage	$ Million	Per-centage
Regular budget	29.5	3.2	33.9	3.6	36.7	3.2
Extrabudgetary resources:						
General programmes	627.9	67.4	617.7	66.0	781.9	67.8
Special programmes	274.0	29.4	284.4	30.4	333.9	29.0
Total	931.4	100.0	936.0	100.0	1 152.5	100.0

Source: A/40/12, annex II, table 1; A/41/12, annex, table 1; A/42/12, annex, table 1; A/43/12, annex, table 1; A/44/12, annex, table 1; A/45/12, table 1.

18. As can be seen from table 1, an overwhelming proportion of UNHCR funding comes from extrabudgetary resources. Another way to illustrate the same point is by noting that, while the regular budget of UNHCR constitutes only a tiny fraction of the overall regular budget of the United Nations, well over 40 per cent of the extrabudgetary resources received by the United Nations as a whole is accounted for by UNHCR, a proportion which no other budget section of the United Nations programme budget comes even close to matching.

19. The reason for this unique distribution of funding is paragraph 20 of the statute of UNHCR, which stipulates that:

> The Office of the High Commissioner shall be financed under the budget of the United Nations. Unless the General Assembly subsequently decides otherwise, no expenditure other than administrative expenditures relating to the functioning of the Office of the High Commissioner shall be borne on the budget of the United Nations and all other expenditures relating to the activities of the High Commissioner shall be financed by voluntary contributions.

20. The distribution of the two types of funding is also reflected in the staffing table of UNHCR, which is presented in table 2.

Table 2. UNHCR staffing table, 1984-1989

	1984-1985			1986-1987			1988-1989		
	RB	XB	Total	RB	XB	Total	RB	XB	Total
Professional and above	120	275	395	120	279	399	99	285	384
General Service	69	166	235	69	166	235	49	202	251
Other categories	101	339	440	101	341	442	96	299	395
Total	290	780	1 070	290	786	1 076	244	786	1 030

Source: 1984-1985: A/40/6, vol. II, table 21.5; 1986-1987: A/42/6 (sect. 21), table 21.5; 1988-1989: A/44/6/Rev.1, table 21.5.

21. It should also be noted, in this context, that the apportionment of expenditures, and the related staffing tables, between the regular budget and extrabudgetary funding has been subject to periodic review and readjustment since the inception of UNHCR. One of the reasons for these reviews, as it was frequently pointed out, has been the fact that while the statute of UNHCR stated that only the administrative expenditures relating to the functioning of the Office of the UNHCR shall be borne by the regular budget, the statute does not define the term "administrative expenditures". The Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions (ACABQ) tried to remedy the situation in 1952 by offering a definition that described administrative expenditures as being all expenses other than operational expenses and the related management costs. 7/ In 1982, ACABQ reiterated the validity of this interpretation of the definition, pointing out that "were it otherwise, the regular budget would become liable for administrative expenses related to operations over which the General Assembly had no direct budgetary control". 8/ In practical terms, the preparation of the three biennial

programme budgets comprising the 1984-1989 period under consideration was governed by the conclusions reached at the last joint review by the Secretary-General and the High Commissioner in 1982. 9/ In this connection, it should also be noted that in 1988 a new agreement was reached by the United Nations Secretariat and the Office of UNHCR on the apportionment of expenditures which has superseded the agreement of 1982 as of the 1990-1991 biennium. 10/

22. Working under an annual budget cycle for over 95 per cent of its funds poses several managerial problems for UNHCR, as has been noted many times in the past. In his opening statement to the forty-first session of the Executive Committee in October 1990, the High Commissioner stated (A/45/12/Add.1, annex, para. 13):

> I cannot conclude my remarks on the financial situation of UNHCR without expressing my deep concern over the crippling effect of the unstable and unpredicatable nature of funding our activities. Living almost on a month-to-month, sometimes week-to-week basis is not only uneconomic - and may I say not very dignified - but it also makes UNHCR a much less responsive and effective organization. The simple truth is that the Office does not have the flexibility today to respond immediately and effectively to new emergencies nor the capacity to plan ahead.

II. PRELIMINARY FINDINGS ON THE PROGRAMME

A. Observations on the programme as a whole

23. As noted above, concern for the protection and material well-being of refugees has been an ongoing preoccupation of the international community throughout much of the twentieth century and especially in the post-Second World War period. Virtually all official and unofficial views would agree with the proposition that the establishment of UNHCR in 1950 on a temporary, albeit renewable, basis, in the hope of outliving its mandate within a few years, exhibited a degree of unwarranted optimism. In fact, the number of refugees or persons in refugee-like situation in 1990 is somewhere around 15 million, about double what it had been a decade ago.

24. Dealing with the continuous flow of refugees on such a large scale and on several continents is, of course, a task of monumental proportions shared by many organizations and agencies, both intergovernmental and non-governmental at the global, regional and national levels. There is, however, a feeling expressed by most authors of the professional literature surveyed for this progress report (see annex I) that in spite of all the commendable efforts on behalf of the refugees, the problems might be growing faster than their solution. As the report of the Independent Commission on International Humanitarian Issues put it (1986, pp. xiii-xiv):

> The international community has attempted to provide most of these refugees with protection and assistance, and to promote lasting solutions to their problems. The framework of laws and organizations established to do so continues to be funded and can draw upon a large body of international experience and expertise. But it is now having difficulty in keeping pace with the developments around the world.

25. There is also at least implicit agreement among most of the authors surveyed with the observation of Gordenker (1987) that "UNHCR has the greatest capacity and experience of all the intergovernmental organizations to respond to emergencies involving the forcible displacement of human beings, especially of those belonging to the formally defined category of refugees" (p. 97).

26. Following established practice of recent evaluation studies, a preliminary survey was made for the present progress report to determine the extent to which the world press identifies the United Nations (and also specifically UNHCR) in its stories on refugees. As was noted in the context of the earlier reports, there is no single measure available to show coverage of a United Nations programme by the entire world press. Moreover, for purposes of evaluating interest in any United Nations programme, the source of data surveyed should be broadly representative of the press coverage given under different political and economic systems. NEXIS, containing wire service coverage, is the most suitable database from that viewpoint because it covers services from a wide variety of sources (see table 3). The wire services in NEXIS are among the main sources of coverage of the United Nations utilized by the press in all parts of the world.

Table 3. Wire service coverage of refugees, 1984-1989

	Stories on refugees						All stories					
	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989
Stories with at least one reference to the United Nations	1 499	2 234	1 706	2 198	5 005	3 583	16 859	19 956	19 519	27 022	39 985	32 176
of which, also UNHCR reference	235	224	198	187	764	565						
Total stories	6 484	8 928	8 109	9 067	12 807	13 261	969 711	958 076	1.03 million	1.34 million	1.34 million	1.34 million
Proportion with United Nations reference (percentage)	23.1	25.0	21.0	24.2	39.1	27.0	1.7	2.1	1.9	2.0	3.0	2.4
Proportion with reference to UNHCR (percentage)	3.6	2.5	2.4	2.1	6.0	4.3						

Source: NEXIS (Dag Hammarskjöld Library) WIRES file: a computer file containing 20 wire services, including AP, ASAHI, Inter-Press Service, JIJI, KYODO, Reuters, TASS, UPI, Xinhua.

27. As can be seen from table 3, over the six-year period surveyed stories on refugees with at least one reference to the United Nations ranged broadly between 20 per cent and 40 per cent of all stories on refugees, a relatively high number, especially in comparison with all stories covered by the wire services where the proportion of United Nations references never exceeded 3 per cent. In that context, it is also to be noted that reference to the United Nations, both in all stories and in stories pertaining to refugees showed a marked increase, in relative as well as absolute terms, in the last two years (i.e. 1988 and 1989) covered by the survey. By way of explanation, one hypothesis that can be put forward, which needs further confirmation, is that this surge of United Nations coverage reflects the revived interest world wide, including the media, in the work of the Organization.

28. Compared to the proportion of stories with references to the United Nations, the proportion of stories on refugees specifically referring to UNHCR is rather small, ranging between 2 per cent and 6 per cent over the six-year period, although it is consistently higher than the proportion of all stories with at least one reference to the United Nations. Several reasons may exist for this. First, it should be borne in mind that stories on "refugees" in their United Nations context encompass also stories such as those on Palestinian refugees, concerning issues which are outside the responsibility of UNHCR. Second, even when a story deals with refugees under UNHCR responsibility, it may mention the United Nations without necessarily identifying by name the Office of the High Commissioner. In that sense "reference to UNHCR" may be too restrictive. It may, however, also be possible that efforts at wider publicity by UNHCR of its work on behalf of refugees would redound to the benefit of the Office. This is an issue which CPC may wish the Secretariat to investigate further and to report on in the in-depth evaluation on the programme of UNHCR, especially as it relates to the effectiveness of the public information strategy of UNHCR.

B. Protection (subprogrammes 1 to 3)

1. General issues

29. One of the major functions of UNHCR, according to its statute, is to provide international protection to refugees. The major objectives of the three subprogrammes on protection, which are best treated together, as set out in the 1984-1989 medium-term plan, can be summarized as follows:

(a) To promote further accession to the 1951 Convention and/or the 1967 Protocol relating to the Status of Refugees, as well as to other universal and regional instruments;

(b) To obtain the widest possible observance by States of internationally accepted standards for the treatment of refugees through, inter alia, the effective implementation of the provisions contained in the 1951 Convention and the 1967 Protocol;

(c) To promote an increased understanding of the special position of refugees; to create a climate of opinion favourable to the strengthening of their legal status; and to promote a wider knowledge of the principles of international protection of refugees.

30. The protection function has two major components. In the first instance, there is the day-to-day responsibility of direct action to protect individuals or groups of refugees whose fundamental rights are in jeopardy or whose general situation requires the intervention of UNHCR with State authorities. Second, UNHCR has the responsibility to work to consolidate and expand the legal framework governing the status and rights of refugees. In essence, this function involves the development, interpretation and promotion of the fundamental principles of refugee protection, with the immediate goal of strengthening international commitments to receive refugees, treat them without discrimination and provide durable solutions based on humanitarian considerations and respect for basic rights.

31. The protection of refugees occupies a prominent place on the agenda of the annual meetings of the Executive Committee, which frequently reiterates the primary nature and fundamental importance of the High Commissioner's protection responsibilities. 11/ The Executive Committee is assisted in carrying out its reviewing functions by a Subcommittee of the Whole on International Protection, which was established in 1975 so that it "would study in more detail some of the more technical aspects of the protection of refugees and would report to the Committee on its findings" (A/AC.96/521, para. 69 (h)).

32. The report of the High Commissioner to the fortieth session of the Executive Committee on the work of the Subcommittee (EC/SCP/56) provides useful perspectives, both retrospectively and prospectively, on some of the major problems involved in carrying out the High Commissioner's protection function. With respect to the past, the report notes (paras. 6-7) that since its inception the Subcommittee has discussed some 25 different subjects and, while most subjects have been considered only once, some intricate problems kept recurring, e.g., two items "Problems related to the rescue of asylum-seekers in distress at sea" and "Military and armed attacks on refugee groups and settlements" were each dealt with at six consecutive meetings of the Subcommittee. As regards the future agenda, the report, in light of the main task of the Subcommittee of highlighting existing shortcomings in the area of refugee protection, identifies seven areas as likely to benefit from more detailed discussion in the future (paras. 17-24):

(a) Refugee protection and human rights;

(b) Security of refugees;

(c) Resettlement and refugee protection;

(d) Border control mechanisms in the context of refugee protection;

(e) Treatment of rejectees;

(f) Protection of personal data on refugees;

(g) International protection and refugee women.

In addition, the High Commissioner, in a more recent note to the Executive Committee (A/AC.96/750), raised a number of other issues concerning refugee protection, such as (a) denial by Governments of access for UNHCR to refugees; (b) detention of refugees and asylum-seekers in circumstances outside the agreed guidelines; (c) the growing challenge to the institution of asylum as a main way of offering protection to refugees; and (d) the financial crisis facing UNHCR, which has adversely affected the Office's ability to protect refugees.

2. Treaties

33. The main instruments of refugee protection are, of course, the international treaties. Here, the primary functions of UNHCR are to promote and encourage further accession, and to promote the broadening of their scope in favour of refugees. As at 1 January 1989, there were 75 multilateral treaties concerning refugees on the roster of UNHCR, divided into several categories (see A/AC.96/INF.172/Rev.2):

Universal instruments		
Refugees and stateless persons	9	
Human rights	10	
Other instruments	12	
Subtotal		31
Regional instruments		
Africa	3	
Americas	9	
Europe	28	
Other regional instruments	4	
Subtotal		44
Total		75

34. Of the 75 multilateral treaties, the two instruments with the broadest international applicability, and the ones which have been on a number of occasions recognized by the Executive Committee as the cornerstone of the international protection of refugees are the 1951 Convention and the 1967

Protocol. As at December 1990, 107 States had ratified one or both instruments.

35. With regard to the implementation of those treaties, the High Commissioner, in a report submitted in 1989 on the implementation of the 1957 Convention and the 1967 Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees noted that in many cases it was quite satisfactory, particularly where "States parties have adopted specific legislative and/or administrative measures to implement the Convention and have ensured that these laws, regulations, or measures are known and understood by the concerned officials" (EC/SCP/54, para. 8). Nevertheless, the report also identified a number of obstacles which impede the full and proper implementation of the Convention in the territory of many contracting States (ibid., paras. 9-22); those obstacles were, generally, three kinds:

(a) Socio-economic considerations;

(b) Legal impediments;

(c) Impediments in policy and practice.

36. Subsequent to the identification of those obstacles, the Executive Committee requested the High Commissioner to prepare a more detailed report on implementation of the 1951 Convention and the 1967 Protocol. UNHCR developed a questionnaire to elicit information from States parties that contains two sets of questions:

(a) Information of a general nature;

(b) Information in relation to selected articles of the Convention, grouped into: (i) those dealing with general rights and obligations; and (ii) those relating to socio-economic, administrative and juridical rights and obligations.

37. The questionnaire was sent to States parties in April 1990, and UNHCR expects to submit a report, based on the responses received, to the forty-second session of the Executive Committee in 1991 (see EC/SCP/61).

3. Promotion, dissemination and training

38. An important aspect of the Office's protection function is the promotion and dissemination of refugee law. Activities in this area include publication of the quarterly Refugee Abstracts and the periodical Refugees, the organization at both the national and international levels of seminars, courses, round tables and conferences, and the provision of opportunities for internships with UNHCR. The aim of those activities is to impart knowledge of laws and principles governing the protection of refugees and the proper recognition of their rights and to provide practical skills to those directly responsible for providing protection to refugees. Table 4 below shows the extent of training seminars in a one-year period, July 1989-July 1990.

Table 4. UNHCR training seminars, July 1989-July 1990

Area	Number of seminars	Number of countries	Number of participants
Africa	6	5	169
Europe and North America	1	1	37
Latin America and the Caribbean	3	3	160
South-west Asia, North Africa and the Middle East	1	1	26
Asia and Oceania	17	8	591

Source: EC/SCP/60.

During the same period, UNHCR awarded 11 internships for a period of 3 months each (see EC/SCP/60, para. 40).

4. Protection of refugee women and children

39. The medium-term plan for the period 1984-1989 (extended to 1991) makes no mention of protection of refugee women and children, and no revision was proposed on any of the three occasions when that plan was revised in accordance with the relevant programme planning regulations and rules. It should be noted, in this context, that it was during the 1980s that the special needs of refugee women and children became more and more acknowledged. Thus, at its thirty-sixth session, the Executive Committee adopted a set of conclusions on "Refugee women and international protection" in which it, inter alia:

...

(c) Noted that refugee women and girls constituted the majority of the world refugee population and that many of them were exposed to special problems in the international protection field;

(d) Recognized that those problems resulted from their vulnerable situation which frequently exposed them to physical violence, sexual abuse and discrimination;

(e) Stressed the need for such problems to receive urgent attention of Governments and the UNHCR ... 12/

40. Similarly, at its thirty-seventh session, the Executive Committee "noted that the situation of refugee children also required special consideration and called upon the High Commissioner to report regularly to the Executive Committee on the needs of refugee children and on existing and proposed programmes for their benefit". 13/

41. The medium-term plan for the period 1992-1997 does refer to the protection of women and children in both the objectives and strategy of subprogramme 2 of programme 36. 14/ It specifically refers to the guidelines developed by UNHCR in recent years both on refugee women and refugee children, which will provide the framework for the in-depth evaluation in this area.

5. Coordination issues related to early warning

42. Another issue that came into increasing prominence in the period from 1984 to 1989 was the growing recognition that one of the most effective ways of dealing with the refugee problem was to avert, to the maximum extent possible, new flows of refugees. Human rights violations were identified as one of the multiple and complex factors causing mass exoduses of refugees and displaced persons, and the United Nations and its agencies were called upon to deal with "the root causes" of the problem.

43. In 1986, the General Assembly, in resolution 41/70 of 3 December, endorsed the conclusions and recommendations of the Group of Governmental Experts on International Co-operation to Avert New Flows of Refugees (A/41/324, annex), which included, inter alia, the recommendation that the main organs of the United Nations make fuller use of their respective competences under the Charter of the United Nations for the prevention of new massive flows of refugees (ibid., para. 4). In subsequent resolutions on human rights and mass exoduses the Assembly has reaffirmed that endorsement and in 1989, after noting that the Secretary-General had instituted an early warning arrangement to avert new massive flows of refugees and displaced persons, the Assembly, in paragraphs 7 and 8 of resolution 44/164 of 15 December 1989, (a) requested the Secretary-General to continue to develop the role of the Office for Research and the Collection of Information of the Secretariat as a focal point for the operation of an effective early-warning system and the strengthening of coordination of information-gathering and analysis among United Nations agencies with a view to preventing new massive flows of reguees and displaced persons; and (b) urged the Secretary-General to use available resources to consolidate and strengthen the system for undertaking early-warning activities in the humanitarian area, by inter alia, early computerization of that Office and strengthened coordination among the relevant parts of the United Nations system, especially that Office, UNHCR, the Centre for Human Rights of the Secretariat and the relevant specialized agencies.

44. In July 1990, the Joint Inspection Unit issued a report entitled "The coordination of activities related to early warning of possible refugee flows" (see A/45/649 and Corr.1), which reinforced the themes of the Assembly resolution just cited. In one of its conclusions, the Inspector noted (ibid., para. 119):

> The General Assembly dealt with the question of early warning of refugee flows in various resolutions. However, it has not been established as a regular component of work in the United Nations system to date, and even its concept is not very familiar. Ten years have already passed since the General Assembly first took up the subject. Yet, the problem of refugee flows has become even more critical. In the light of the importance and urgent need of the early warning system, the Inspectors feel that strategies should be established both for short- and longer-term objectives.

45. While the report primarily addressed one of the functions of the Office for Research and the Collection of Information, it made also clear, in another of its conclusions, its relevance to UNHCR. The Unit recommended in paragraph 129 of the report that ACC should:

> Establish a working group on early warning of refugee flows, consisting of representatives of ORCI, UNHCR, Centre for Human Rights, UNDRO, FAO and UNESCO, as well as those of ODG/DIEC, UNDP, DPI, WFP and WMO, to work out practical measures for modes of co-operation and procedures to develop an effective early warning system for refugees; and
>
> Set forth a regular inter-agency consultative mechanism which should consider concrete cases of early warning of possible refugee flows and meet urgently in case of emergencies (ORCI and UNHCR serving as the joint convener and secretariat of such a mechanism).

46. The medium-term plan for the period 1992-1997, adopted by the General Assembly at its forty-fifth session, listed Assembly resolutions 41/70 and 44/164 as legislative mandates of programme 1, subprogramme 3 (Research and the collection of information) (A/45/6, para. 1.17). CPC, reviewing the plan, recommended that the legislative authority of programme 36, subprogramme 1 (International instruments relating to the status of refugees or otherwise benefiting refugees) should also include Assembly resolution 44/164 as a mandate. 15/ Subsequently, the Assembly in its resolution 45/253, section I, of 21 December 1990 adopted the 1992-1997 medium-term plan and concluded that references to both Assembly resolutions 41/70 and 44/164 should be inserted as mandates under programmes 35 (Promotion and protection of human rights), 36 (International protection of and assistance to refugees) and 37 (Disaster relief and mitigation, and special emergency programmes) (see also the annex to the resolution).

6. Views expressed in the professional literature

47. While most of the authors surveyed agree that protection of refugees is an important function of UNHCR, many of them tend to emphasize the limitations upon the Office of the High Commissioner in the performance of this function. There is, however, no unanimity regarding how far this limitation goes. Garvey (1985) states that "the legal mandate of the UNHCR is such that neither the country expelling refugees nor political states of refuge are under obligation even to permit UNHCR to operate in their territory" (p. 489). Nevertheless, as the Independent Commission on International Humanitarian Issues (1986) argues, "protection must remain the cornerstone of the High Commissioner's work. Without it, his Office may become just another large relief agency." At the same time, the Commission also notes the limitations. It observes that "the role of UNHCR in international protection for refugees has its roots in the doctrine of diplomatic protection, by which a State may insist on respect for the fundamental rights of its citizens by other states". But while States have a number of devices at their disposal for this purpose, UNCHR does not. "Its only weapon is diplomatic pressure in the form of moral persuasion, protest, and, ultimately, public condemnation" (p. 55). Dunbar-Ortiz and Harrell-Bond (1987), however, think that there is more to it than that, viz. economic power: "the aid programme has enormous potential for preventing many of the situations which give rise to the breach of human rights of the refugees" (p. 117).

48. With regard to non-refoulement, one of the cardinal principles of protection, Gordenker (1987) notes that it is more the attitude of the government concerned than the intervention of UNHCR on behalf of the refugees which is decisive. That said, however, he adds that "as UNHCR has offices in some 90 countries, it has in any case more capacity and skill than any other organization to react to an emergency in which the rights of refugees to be free from the threat of refoulement are threatened" (p. 98).

49. There is considerable debate - and disagreement - in the professional literature on the question whether the term "refugee", as defined in the 1951 Convention, is adequate for contemporary conditions and, if not, what to do about it. Virtually, all the authors surveyed agree that the definition set forth in the 1951 Convention and 1967 Protocol does not characterize the majority of forced migrants or disaster victims crossing international borders. Moreover, as Gallagher (1989) notes, "internally displaced people outnumber refugees and the international system fails to reach many of the refugees most in the need of help" (p. 589). Many of the same authors note that, in any case, UNHCR responds, beyond the legal definition, to refugee-like situations at the request of the General Assembly or of Governments. But the concern of these authors is that this is done, of necessity, on an ad hoc basis and thus UNHCR's umbrella of protection, material assistance and help in finding permanent solutions are extended to some but not all groups of people in such situations. Thus, Howland (1987) states that the legal definition provided by the 1951 Convention and the 1967 Protocol should be broadened. On the other hand, Ferris (1985), Lentini (1985), Macalistar-Smith (1985), the Commission (1986) and Gordenker (1987)

argue that, rather than attempting to change the legal definitions, a more effective approach would be to formally expand the institutional mandate of UNHCR and support it with additional funding from donor States, to foster coherent and rapid assistance to the most vulnerable forced migrants of the world.

50. Many of the authors surveyed, e.g. Hodges (1984), Pitterman (1984), Rizvi (1985), Harrell-Bond (1986), Hailbronner (1986), the Commission (1986), Kennedy (1986), Howland (1987) and Gallagher (1989), seem to agree that from a humanitarian standpoint a strict definition of a "refugee" is besides the point, an argument perhaps best expressed by Gordenker (1987): "From a humanitarian point of view, it could be argued that all persons sent into flight by disaster should be cared for immediately. To separate out the refugees on the basis of political persecution misses the point" (p. 205). In this view, then, the issue is not so much definition as mandate, the change of which is more easily manageable through legislation than the more cumbersome treaty process.

51. Finally, on the question of preventing refugee flows, Macalister-Smith (1985), Opitz (1985), Stein (1985), the Commission (1986), Gordenker (1987) and Gallagher (1989) all agree that development of an early warning system would be desirable. Shawcross (1984) and Harrell-Bond (1986) comment on the slowness of UNHCR in recognizing a refugee crisis in the making. And the Commission (1986) concludes that "effective early warning systems should lead not only to contingency planning, but also to appropriate preventive measures" (p. 135).

C. Durable solutions and material assistance (subprogrammes 4 to 7)

1. Nature of durable solutions and assistance

52. The second type of major activity of UNHCR, as specified in its statute and relevant General Assembly resolutions, is to facilitate the finding of durable solutions for refugees, to provide material assistance in the form of temporary care and maintenance and to extend emergency relief of a humanitarian nature in case of refugee emergencies.

(a) Durable solutions. The three types of durable solutions promoted by UNHCR and the associated objectives, as set out in subprogrammes 4 to 6 of the medium-term plan, are:

(i) Voluntary repatriation. To promote the voluntary repatriation of refugees to their country of origin and to provide assistance, as needed, to the returnees as well as to the country of origin in order to facilitate their reintegration;

(ii) Local settlement. To provide the material conditions under which refugee groups and individuals can become self-supporting in the country of first asylum;

(iii) Resettlement. To promote the resettlement of refugees from the country of first asylum when, for a variety of reasons, refugees - both individuals and groups - cannot settle in the country of first asylum;

(b) Care and maintenance. When, for a variety of reasons - political, physical, environmental or socio-economic - rapid identification and implementation of durable solutions prove to be unfeasible, UNHCR provides intermediate care and maintenance which may include the provision of food, shelter, transportation, water, health services, clothing, etc. and, where possible, vocational training;

(c) Emergency assistance. UNHCR is also called upon to respond to emergency refugee situations by providing relief of a humanitarian nature. The High Commissioner is authorized to allocate up to $20 million annually to an Emergency Fund for this purpose.

2. Allocation of resources

53. The allocation of UNHCR expenditures by main type of activities over the three bienniums of the 1984-1989 medium-term plan is shown in table 5.

54. Several points are to be noted in table 5. First, on the whole, UNHCR expends about as much money (or donations in kind) on intermediate care and maintenance and emergency assistance as it does on the three types of durable solutions. Second, inasmuch as voluntary repatriation is considered as the most preferred of the three durable solutions, the trend in the six-year period shows that expenditures in this category increased fourfold in absolute terms and more than three times proportionately. Third, local settlement accounts for by far the largest proportion of the expenditures allocated to durable solutions, reflecting the limited capacity of the countries of first asylum - many of them developing countries - to absorb large influxes of refugees or asylum-seekers.

55. Table 6 shows the geographical distribution of UNHCR expenditures in the same 1984-1989 period. The most noteworthy feature of the data presented in table 6 is that, despite the ebb and flow of refugees in the second half of the 1980s, the allocation of assistance by UNHCR among the regions remained remarkably constant. While there has been some relative decline in the share of the Latin America and Caribbean region and a slight relative increase in the European and North American region, the 1988-1989 relative allocation does not look materially different from that of 1984-1985.

Table 5. UNHCR expenditures by main types of assistance activities, 1984-1989 a/

	1984-1985		1986-1987		1988-1989	
	$ million	per-centage	$ million	per-centage	$ million	per-centage
Voluntary repatriation b/	26.5	3.2	50.9	6.4	109.9	11.1
Local settlement c/	301.2	36.5	378.1	47.6	346.6	34.9
Resettlement	32.8	4.0	35.3	4.4	37.2	3.8
Care, maintenance and emergency assistance d/	465.1	56.3	330.8	41.6	498.1	50.2
Total	825.6	100.0	795.1	100.0	991.8	100.0

Source: A/40/12, annex II, table 2; A/41/12, annex, table 2; A/42/12, annex, table 2; A/43/12, annex, table 2; A/44/12, annex, table 2; A/45/12, table 2.

a/ Not including expenditure for programme support and administration.

b/ Including assistance to returnees.

c/ Including income-generating activities.

d/ Including donations in kind, e.g. food, etc.

Table 6. Distribution of UNHCR expenditures by regions, 1984-1989

	1984-1985		1986-1987		1988-1989	
	$ million	per-centage	$ million	per-centage	$ million	per-centage
Africa, including North Africa	409.9	44.0	394.8	42.2	523.3	45.4
Latin America and the Caribbean	83.9	9.0	78.5	8.4	80.8	7.0
Europe and North America	33.0	3.6	38.1	4.1	51.7	4.5
Asia and Oceania	155.0	16.6	145.9	15.6	193.6	16.8
South-west Asia and the Middle East	191.8	20.6	197.6	21.1	207.7	18.0
Global allocations	57.9	6.2	81.1	8.6	95.3	8.3
Total	931.5	100.0	936.0	100.0	1 152.4	100.0

Source: See table 1.

3. Intergovernmental concerns

56. Intergovernmental bodies reviewing the activities of UNHCR in the area of durable solutions and refugee assistance have expressed a number of concerns; the most important can be summarized as follows:

(a) Need for the international community to provide resettlement opportunities for those refugees for whom no other durable solution may be in sight, with particular attention given to refugees who have already spent an inordinately long time in camps;

(b) The destabilizing effect caused by irregular movements of refugees on structured international efforts to provide appropriate solutions. (Irregular movements refer to movements of refugees from countries in which they have already found protection to another country, which they enter without the prior consent of national authorities or without entry visa, or with insufficient or fraudulent documentation, to seek asylum or permanent resettlement);

(c) The shortage of funds available to the High Commissioner, especially in light of the growing number of refugees and asylum-seekers;

(d) The relationship between refugee assistance and development aid and, in that context, the role of UNHCR as a "catalytic agent" as well as the focal point of coordination within the United Nations system. 16/

4. UNHCR evaluations

57. As shown in annex II, UNHCR has had for many years an elaborate system of evaluation that has given rise to 42 reports, primarily on country assistance projects, in the 1984-1989 period. This material was too extensive to be analysed for the progress report.

5. Views expressed in the professional literature

58. Several of the authors surveyed commented on the evolution of the steadily broadening functions of UNHCR with greater and greater emphasis on assistance. Thus, Gordenker (1987), echoed also by Kennedy (1986), sums up the historical record as "one of unbroken expansion of functions on behalf of refugees. This expansion took place in terms of geographic location, numbers and variety of services offered. The nature of the expansion can be seen from bureaucratic construction employed by UNHCR. The handful of lawyers specializing in legal protection have long since been overshadowed in number by the bureau concerned with assistance to refugees. This far outstrips every other in expenditures" (p. 36). The Commission (1986) expresses the view, supported by Stein (1986) and Feitsma (1989), that more should be done about durable solutions even if at the expense of assistance: "If UNHCR is to offer a wide range of options, it must work much more flexibly, spending less money on open-ended relief programmes and far more on imaginative schemes that allow refugees to fulfil their aspirations" (p. 68).

59. A number of authors, however, also pointed to problems with the various durable solution schemes. This, while Pitterman (1985), Stein (1986) and Gallagher (1989) agree that voluntary repatriation of refugees is the best of the durable solutions, Stein also notes that it is the one "least effectively promoted by the international community. Many disputes are too political to allow any UNHCR humanitarian role. There is no alternative mechanism that can be relied on to promote or force negotiations" (p. 272). As regards the country of first asylum, Harrell-Bond (1985), Stein (1985) and Gallagher (1989) all concur with Rizvi's (1985) statement that "the government of the country of first asylum (host country) is sometimes unwilling to accept the incoming mass of people as refugees ... most States receiving refugees are poor and underdeveloped. They view the incoming refugees as a drain on their meager economic resources" (p. 56). Concerning third country resettlement, Rizvi (1985) notes that "the experience of resettlement of refugees show that it is a complex and slow process involving international agencies, the government of the host country as well as the government of the state accepting refugees for permanent settlement. A large number of refugees have to spend years in the camps or outside on international dole before they are offered permanent settlement" (p. 59).

60. Those of the authors surveyed who commented on financial matters were virtually unanimous in their view that the money that is available to UNHCR is not commensurate with the existing refugee needs. Most of these authors noted that UNHCR must rely on voluntary contributions and they found that arrangement less than satisfactory, partly because - as Pitterman (1989) and the Commission (1986) agree - the policies and priorities of UNHCR can be influenced by the major donors but mostly because the need for annual fund-raising introduces a large element of uncertainty and unpredictability, which leads to a hand-to-mouth approach to assisting refugees and prevents the financing of long-term durable solutions.

61. Several authors also reflect on the connection between refugee assistance and development aid. Thus, Pitterman (1984) states that "it is not possible after the initial relief stages of a refugee crisis to effectively promote the economic integration of the refugee without taking into account the needs of the local population or the capabilities of the regional infrastructure" (p. 136). But Stein (1985), Chambers (1986) and Gordenker (1987) list a host of reasons why refugee assistance alone might have a potentially harmful local impact, including distortion of ongoing development programmes, market distortions and perception of undeserved rewards received by refugees without working. Dunbar-Ortiz and Harrell-Bond (1987) strongly concur with this last point and add that "if the local community among whom refugees live are to continue to tolerate their presence it is also necessary to convince the international donors that it is urgent to revise the total policy and assist the people on the basis of need, rather than to continue to earmark aid to refugees alone" (p. 112). Hodges (1984), writing specifically on Africa's refugee crisis, arrives at the same conclusion by noting that most African countries cannot absorb large numbers of refugees productively (p. 10).

III. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE IN-DEPTH EVALUATION

62. The UNHCR component of United Nations activities concerning international protection of and assistance to refugees is the largest single programme of the United Nations. The activities undertaken by UNHCR encompass a wide spectrum, including promotion of international treaties, protection, dissemination of information, search for durable solutions for refugees, care and maintenance and emergency relief. Over 95 per cent of UNHCR activities are financed from extrabudgetary resources.

63. In this progress report all those activities of UNHCR have been touched upon. Given the enormous scope and complexity of UNHCR's activities, however, the in-depth evaluation report will have to focus on a few key issues.

64. In light of the information reviewed in this progress report, it is recommended that the in-depth evaluation focus on the following issues:

A. Prevention

(a) Adequacy of the Office's mandate. It has repeatedly been suggested that the Office's mandate, based on its statute drawn up more than 40 years ago, does not fully reflect the contemporary refugee situation. As discussed above, this has direct relevance for both of the Office's major functions, i.e., protection and durable solutions. The views of Member States regarding this issue would be sought by means of questionnaires distributed to members of the Third Committee and the UNHCR Executive Committee, supplemented by further exploration of the existing legal literature. The views of non-governmental organizations active in refugee assistance would also be sought by questionnaires and interviews.

(b) Early warning. Both the High Commissioner and the Executive Committee have been increasingly emphasizing the role of prevention in finding solutions to refugee problems. An important element of prevention is a well-functioning early warning scheme and the role of UNHCR in such a scheme is crucial. Given the many organizations of the United Nations system which are participating in early warning assessments, coordination is of central importance. The effectiveness of participation of UNHCR in the coordinating machinery would be assessed through review of the relevant documentation and in-depth interviews with representatives of all units and agencies concerned followed, if necessary, by questionnaires based on these interviews.

(c) Training. In a recent one-year period nearly 1,000 participants attended UNHCR training seminars. The effectiveness of the training courses and seminars would be examined by reviewing internal UNHCR assessments of these programmes and by questionnaires to a representative sample of recent participants and their sponsoring Governments.

B. Assistance

(d) Assistance. During the 1984-1989 period, UNHCR completed the 42 evaluation studies listed in annex II. In order to examine the effectiveness of the refugee assistance provided by UNHCR, a systematic review, inter alia, of UNHCR internal evaluation reports would be undertaken, with special attention to the intergovernmental concerns indicated in paragraph 56. The review would focus exclusively on issues that were of concern in more than one country. This review of UNHCR evaluation reports would be supplemented by examination of other relevant documents, including reports of the Internal Audit Division, and interviews with auditors if appropriate.

C. Managerial issues

(e) Dissemination. The effectiveness of UNHCR dissemination activities, in particular of the periodical Refugees and the quarterly Refugee Abstracts, would be examined by the use of questionnaires addressed to a sample of the recipients of these publications.

(f) Publicity by UNHCR of its activities on behalf of refugees. The nature of world press coverage of UNHCR would be assessed by a detailed examination of wire service stories, supplemented by interviews with and questionnaires to the United Nations press corps and other relevant groups, such as non-governmental organizations, in order to determine the quality of the coverage and the scope for improvements.

(g) The annual funding and budget cycle. The effects of the compressed cycle of fund-raising and decisions on expenditure would be examined by reviews of internal UNHCR documentation and questionnaires and interviews with donor and recipient governments and the agencies providing services to refugees under contract to UNHCR.

65. The period covered by the evaluation should be that of the current medium-term plan, namely, 1984 to 1991.

66. It should be noted that a great deal of ongoing work is being carried out currently on several of the issues raised in this progress report:

(a) A Working Group on Solutions and Protection of the Executive Committee of UNHCR was set up in 1990 to examine protection and solutions in a coherent and comprehensive manner, bearing in mind the mandate of the High Commissioner. The Working Group aims at clarifying basic concepts bearing on protection and solutions, with a view to identifying realistic approaches to the range of current protection problems facing, or posed by, different categories or groups of refugees and asylum-seekers.

(b) Evaluation for UNHCR, by an outside consultant, of the overall effectiveness of the UNHCR public information service, including:

(i) Review of all public information activities of UNHCR bearing in mind the overall objectives of the organization;

(ii) Evaluation of the goals of the UNHCR public information activities;

(iii) Examination of target audiences, including the media, Governments and non-governmental organizations and review of specific means of communication for reaching them;

(iv) Evaluation of the logistics used to attain goals;

(v) Examination of ways of optimizing cost/benefit;

(vi) Methods of ongoing evaluation for public information activities;

(c) Evaluation for UNHCR, by an outside consultant, of the overall effectiveness of the UNHCR fund raising function, including:

(i) Review of its mode of programme financing and a comparison of it with that of other organizations with a similar humanitarian mandate;

(ii) Review of the Office's programme budgeting and presentation, with particular reference to the submission of programmes for donor funding;

(iii) Review of the current system used by UNHCR in addressing donors for financial support;

(iv) Review of the reporting requirements in connection with the voluntary contributions;

(v) Recommendations for the improvement of the Office's basic funding mechanism;

(vi) Recommendations for improvements in the structure of UNHCR in the resource-building sector;

(d) A United Nations system-wide review is being conducted by the Office of the Director-General for Development and International Economic Cooperation:

(i) To assess the experience and capacity of various organizations in the coordination of assistance to all refugees, displaced persons and returnees and the full spectrum of their needs and in supporting the efforts of the affected countries;

(ii) To recommend ways of maximizing cooperation and coordination among the various organizations of the United Nations system in order to ensure an effective response by the United Nations system to the problems of refugees, displaced persons and returnees, keeping in mind the mandates of the United Nations organizations concerned (in accordance with Economic and Social Council resolution 1990/78).

(e) In February 1991, a UNHCR task force on early warning was established under the chairmanship of the Deputy High Commissioner (its terms of reference and method of work are to be determined).

Notes

1/ Official Records of the General Assembly, Forty-fourth Session, Supplement No. 16 (A/44/16), para. 318.

2/ Ibid., Forty-fifth Session, Supplement No. 16 (A/45/16), part one, para. 363.

3/ Ibid., Forty-second Session, Supplement No. 16 (A/42/16), part one, para. 236.

4/ United Nations, Treaty Series, No. 2545, vol. 189, p. 137.

5/ Ibid., No. 8791, vol. 606, p. 267.

6/ Official Records of the General Assembly, Thirty-seventh Session, Supplement No. 6 (A/37/6).

7/ Ibid., Seventh Session, Supplement No. 7 (A/2157), paras. 361-367.

8/ Ibid., Thirty-seventh Session, Supplement No. 7A (A/37/7/Add.1), document A/37/7/Add.3, para. 12.

9/ For details of these conclusions see A/C.5/37/1 and Corr.1. This report contains also a historical background to the questions of apportioning administrative costs between the regular budget and extrabudgetary funds.

10/ See Official Records of the General Assembly, Forty-fourth Session, Supplement No. 6 (A/44/6/Rev.1), vol. II, paras. 21.5-21.7.

11/ Ibid., Supplement No. 12A (A/44/12/Add.1), para. 22 (a).

12/ Ibid., Fortieth Session, Supplement No. 12A (A/40/12/Add.1), para. 115 (4).

13/ Ibid., Forty-first Session, Supplement No. 12A (A/41/12/Add.1), para. 125 (m).

14/ A/45/6 (Prog. 36), paras. 36.29, 36.30 and 36.33. To be issued in Official Records of the General Assembly, Forty-fifth Session, Supplement No. 6 (A/45/6/Rev.1).

15/ Official Records of the General Assembly, Forty-fifth Session, Supplement No. 16 (A/45/16), part one, para. 312 (b).

16/ For a comprehensive review of the historical background and many of the conceptual issues involved in the area of refugee aid and development, see A/AC.96/736.

ANNEX I

Bibliography of the professional literature consulted

The articles and books reviewed for this report pertain, in most part, to United Nations activities in the area of refugees and were published during the period 1984-1990. Excluded from the list were books and articles written by United Nations staff members and government officials, as well as those that relate to the Palestinian refugees since they fall under the jurisdiction of United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA).

The review was based on two computer-generated bibliographies from the United Nations Dag Hammarskjöld Library and the UNHCR Centre for Documentation on Refugees, supplemented by entries from the "Dialog" Information Retrieval Service, available through Dag Hammarskjöld Library.

While not exhaustive, the books and articles are a large sample of the professional literature pertaining to UNHCR. The literature is of high quality and reflects the thinking of many professional disciplines and sciences such as law, sociology, anthropology and political science. The articles appeared in internationally recognized journals, and most contained detailed, well-referenced and objective analyses.

Anker, D. E. Discretionary asylum: a protection remedy for refugees under the Refugee Act of 1980. Virginia Journal of International Law 28(1) 1987: 1-72.

Bernard, Cheryl. Politics and the refugee experience. Political Science Quarterly 101(4) 1986: 617-636.

Bettati, Mario. L'asile politique en question: un statut pour les réfugiés. Paris, Presses universitaires de France, 1985.

Bramwell, A. C. (ed.). Refugees in the Age of Total War. London, Unwin, 1988.

Bringuier, P. Réflexions sur le statut du Haut Commissaire des Nations Unies pour les réfugiés. Fondation GIPRI: Cahier de recherches, 1988.

Casella, A. The refugees from Vietnam: Rethinking the issue. World Today 45(8-9) 1989: 160-164.

Chambers, S. Hidden losers: The impact of rural refugees and refugee programs on poorer hosts. International Migration Review 20(2) 1986: 245-263.

Clark, B. International protection of refugees: trends and developments in treatment of refugees. Yearbook of the International Institute of Humanitarian Law 1989.

Cox, Theodore N. Well-founded fear of being persecuted: the sources and application of a criterion of refugee status. Brooklyn Journal of International Law 10(2) Summer 1984: 333-379.

Crisp, Jeff. Ugandan refugees in Sudan and Zaire: the problem of repatriation. African Affairs 85(339) 1986: 163-180.

Crisp, Jeff. Refugee repatriation: new pressures and problems. Migration World 14(5) 1986: 13-20.

Cutler, P. The response to drought of Beja famine refugees in Sudan. Disasters 10(3) 1986: 181-188.

Dunbar-Ortiz, R; Harrell-Bond, B. E. Africa rights monitor: Who protects the human rights of refugees. Africa Today 34(1-2) 1987: 105-125.

Feitsma, John. Repatriation law and refugees. Netherlands quarterly of human rights 7(3) 1989: 294-307.

Ferris, E. G. (ed.). Refugees and World Politics. New York, Praeger, 1985.

Friedl, Reinhold. Erziehung und Ausbildung für Flüchtlinge in Afrika: Möglichkeiten und Grenzen der Ausbildungshilfe des Hochkommissariats für Flüchtlinge der Vereinten Nationen (UNHCR). Hamburg, Institut für Afrika-Kunde, 1987.

Fullerton, M. Restricting the Flow of asylum-seekers in Belgium, Denmark, the Federal Republic of Germany and the Netherlands: new challenges to the Geneva convention relating to the status of refugees and the European Convention on Human Rights. Virginia Journal of International Law 29(1) 1988: 33-114.

Gallagher, D. (ed.). Refugees: Issues and Directions. Special Issue. International Migration Review 20(2) 1986.

Gallagher, D. The era of refugees: the evolution of the international refugee system. Washington, D.C., Refugee Policy Group, 1989.

Garvey, Jack I. Toward a reformulation of international refugee law. Harvard International Law Journal 26(2) Spring 1985: 483-500.

Goodwilling, G. S. International law and human rights: trends concerning international migrants and refugees. International Migration Review 23(3) 1989: 526-546.

Gordenker, Leon. Refugees in International Politics. London, Croom Helm, 1987.

Grahl-Madsen, Atle. Protection of refugees by their country of origin. Yale Journal of International Law 11(2) Spring 1986: 362-395.

Hailbronner, Kay. Non-refoulement and "humanitarian" refugees: customary international law or wishful legal thinking? Virginia Journal of International Law 26(4) Summer 1986: 857-896.

Hakovirta, Harto. Third World Conflicts and Refugeeism: Dimensions, Dynamics and Trends of the World Refugee Problem. Helsinki, The Finnish Society of Sciences and Letters, 1986.

Harrell-Bond, Barbara. Humanitarianism in a straitjacket. African Affairs 84 (334) Jan. 1985: 3-13.

Harrell-Bond, B. E. Imposing Aid: Emergency Assistance to Refugees. Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1986.

Hodges, Tony. Africa's Refugee Crisis. Africa Report 29(1) Jan./Feb. 1984: 4-10.

Howland, Todd. A comparative analysis of the changing definition of a refugee. New York Law School Journal of Human Rights 5(1) Fall 1987: 33-70.

Hyndman, Patricia. The 1951 Convention definition of refugees: an appraisal with particular reference to the case of Sri Lankan Tamil applicants. Human Rights Quarterly 9(1) Feb. 1987: 49-73.

Independent Commission on International Humanitarian Issues. Refugees: The Dynamics of Displacement. London, Zed Books Ltd.; 1986.

Kennedy, D. International Refugee Protection. Human Rights Quarterly 8(1) 1986: 1-69.

Kooijmans, P. H. Trends and developments in asylum and admission of refugees. Yearbook of the International Institute of Humanitarian Law 1989: 153-160.

Lee, L. T. The UN Group of Governmental Experts on international co-operation to avert new flows of refugees. American Journal of International Law 78(2) 1984: 480-484.

Lee, L. T. Toward a world without refugees: The United Nations group of governmental experts on international co-operation to avert new flows of refugees. British Yearbook of International Law 1986: 317-336.

Lee, L. T. The right to compensation: refugees and countries of asylum. American Journal of International Law 80(3) 1986: 532-567.

Lentini, Elizabeth J. The definition of refugee in international law: proposals for the future. Boston College Third World Law Journal 5(2) June 1985: 183-198.

Loescher, G. The European Community and refugees. International Affairs 65(4) 1989: 617-636.

Mecalister-Smith, Peter. International humanitarian assistance for refugees: law and practice. Indian Journal of International Law 25(3/4) July/Dec. 1985: 365-385.

Mazur, R. E. Linking popular initiative and aid agencies: the case of refugees. Development and Change 18(3) 1987: 437-461.

Muntarbhorn, Vitit. Protection and assistance for refugees in armed conflicts and internal disturbances: reflections on the mandates of the International Red Cross and Red Crescent Movement and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. International Review of the Red Cross No. 265, July/Aug. 1988: 351-366.

Mwase, N. R. L. The repatriation, rehabilitation and resettlement of Namibian refugees at independence. Community Development Journal 25(2) 1990: 113-121.

Ngolle, Elvis. The African refugee problem and the distribution of international refugee assistance in comparative perspective: an empirical analysis of the policies of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) 1960-1980.

Opitz, Peter J. Refugee Policy and German UN initiative. Aussenpolitik 36(3) 1985: 332-344.

Patrnogic, Jovica. Thoughts on the relationship between international humanitarian law and refugee law, their promotion and dissemination. International Review of the Red Cross No. 265, July/Aug. 1988: 367-378.

Pitterman, S. Determinants of Policy in a Functional International Agency: A Comparative Study of United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) Assistance in Africa, 1963-1981. Evanston, Illinois, Northwestern University Press, 1984 (Ph.D. thesis).

Ramos, M. L. E. and Escudero, M. M. The law regulating asylum and condition of refugees as of March 26, 1984 - Nationalism or internationalism. Revista de Estudios Internacionales 6(1) 1985: 73-110 (in Spanish).

Refugee Policy Group (ed.). Early Warning of Mass Refugee Flows. Washington, D.C., 1986.

Rizvi, Hasan-Askari. United Nations and the refugee problem. Pakistan Horizon 38(1) 1985: 46-59.

Schultheis, Michael J. Les réfugiés dans le monde. Etudes 365(3), September 1986: 149-162.

Shawcross, William. The Quality of Mercy. New York, Simon and Schuster, 1984.

Singh, N. The Role and Record of the UN High Commissioner for Refugees. New Delhi, MacMillan Indian Ltd., 1984.

Stein, B. N. Durable solutions for developing country refugees. International Migration Review 20(2) 1986: 264-282.

Teitelbaum, M. S. Immigration, refugees and foreign policy. International Organizations 38(3) 1984: 429-450.

Warbrick, C. Refugees - Investment promotion and protection agreements - The International Tin Council. International and Comparative Law Quarterly 36(Oct.) 1987: 924-929.

Warbrick, C. Refugees. International and Comparative Law Quarterly, 37(Apr.) 1988: 428-429

Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children. Report on the situation of women and children in UN and UNHCR-administered refugee operations. New York, 1989.

Wood, W. B. Long-time coming: The repatriation of Afghan refugees. Annals of the Association of American Geographers 79(3) 1989: 345-369.

Zetter, R. Refugees: access and labelling. Development and Change 16(3) 1985: 429-450.

ANNEX II

UNHCR evaluation reports, 1984-1989

Year	Country/subject
1984	Honduras
	Philippines
	Angola
	Tanzania/Zambia
	Laotian refugees in Thailand
	Assistance to urban refugees in Africa
1985	Lesotho
	Costa Rica/Dominican Republic
	Model for urban refugees
	Eastern Sudan
	Germany
1986	Japan
	Hong Kong
	Review of food aid
	Shaba Region - Zaire
	Argentina
	Yugoslavia
	Greece
1987	Italy
	India
	Pakistan
	Turkey
	Zaire
	West Africa
	Kenya
	Papua New Guinea
	Social services
1988	Somalia
	Ethiopia
	Chadian refugees in the Central African Republic and Cameroon
	Ad Hoc Committee on Operations Review/Operational Review Teams
	West Africa
	Mozambique
	Belize/Guatemala/Mexico
	Swaziland
	Zimbabwe

Year	Country/subject
1989	Tanzania
	Eastern Sudan
	Commissioner of Refugees staffing in Sudan
	Botswana
	Malawi
	Zambia